



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES

Friday, November 14, 2014, 2:00 pm

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Turner called the Special Meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.

Members Present

Jim Turner, Chair
Jack Hodgson, Vice-Chair
David Pounds, Secretary
David Blackburn
Tom Neal *
David Schoell
John Snyder
*Late

Members Absent

Susan McKee
Robert Shears
Ted Reeds Ex-Officio
Pam Deatherage Ex-Officio

Staff Present

Amanda DeCort, Mark Swiney, Suzanna Auerbach

Others Present

Chad Osgood, Wendy Drummond,

2. Approval of Minutes from October 28, 2014. Commissioner Hodgson made a motion to approve Regular Minutes from October 28. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes October 28, 2014.

In Favor

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

1. Blackburn
2. Hodgson
3. Pounds
4. Schoell
5. Snyder
6. Turner

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

No one reported a conflict of interest with the proposals on the agenda.

B. Actionable Items

4. McBirney Mansion Easement-Review of Changes

Note: As the applicants for the McBirney Mansion were present and other COA applicants were not present, Action Item #4 – Review of Changes proposed under the McBirney Mansion Easement - was moved ahead of the COA presentations.

Applicant: Chad Osgood for Wendy and Gentner Drummond

Amanda DeCort presented a summary of the easement, and provided Commissioners with a slideshow of the property, then presented the requests that the Commission would be considering.

Request:

1. Remove non-original rear patio and steps adjacent to kitchen door; replace with poured concrete patio and steps to allow for safe exit from kitchen, according to plans submitted. Located to the rear of the home and minimally visible from adjoining streets.

Applicant Wendy Drummond stated the rear patio and steps were not believed to be original to the house and are difficult to use. She said that the non-original rear patio will be replaced with poured concrete to make the space more useable. Mrs. Drummond stated the current condition of the area where the patio will be placed is unacceptable, and the new concrete patio will be an improvement. She noted that the “patio” is small and really more of a landing.

Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Turner seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: McBirney Mansion Easement-Patio

In Favor **Opposed** **Abstaining** **Not Present**

1. Blackburn
2. Hodgson
3. Neal
4. Pounds
5. Schoell
6. Snyder
7. Turner

Request:

2. Construct 4' wooden fences with iron gates, wrapping around the rear patio to create a dog run area and enclosures for trash and recycling bins, according to plans submitted. Buffer with shrubbery similar to existing. Located to the rear of the home and minimally visible from adjoining streets. *Condition: New fence is not to exceed 3-4' to west beyond extent of home.*

Amanda DeCort showed more photographs of the existing property and small wooden fences currently in place. Applicant Wendy Drummond stated the fence would block the undesirable view they have from their backyard. In addition adding a trash enclosure will hide the containers from eyes view and give a softer look to the property.

Chad Osgood stated that the fence would be cedar planks as indicated in the plans. He added that they would like to expand the fenced area a small distance beyond the corner of the property. *The condition was added to the motion that the fence would extend no more than 4 feet beyond the corner of the house.*

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Hodgson seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously with conditions.

Vote: McBirney Mansion Easement - Fence

In Favor **Opposed** **Abstaining** **Not Present**

1. Blackburn
2. Hodgson
3. Neal
4. Pounds
5. Schoell
6. Snyder
7. Turner

Request:

- 3. Pour concrete pad no larger than 20 x 20 along the property line to place generator and utility equipment. Buffer with shrubbery. Located to the rear of the home and minimally visible from adjoining streets.

Applicant Chad Osgood stated that they will be placing a generator and air conditioning units on the concrete pad. He thinks they will be approximately 15' x 20' but he does not have exact dimensions at this time, as the survey has just been completed. *The Commission added the condition to the motion that the concrete pad be no larger than 20' by 20'.*

Commissioner Blackburn made a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Hodgson seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously, with conditions.

Vote: McBirney Mansion Easement - Utility Pad

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Blackburn			
2. Hodgson			
3. Neal			
4. Pounds			
5. Schoell			
6. Snyder			
7. Turner			

Request:

- 4. Change color of painted stucco to lighter color.

Example photos were shown of the current stucco, as well as a photo showing a similar home painted in the proposed color. Commissioner Turner asked what the easement states on changing the color of paint on the property. Staff noted that the easement did not reference paint specifically. Applicant Wendy Drummond stated she didn't see reference to paint in the easement, but stated she would be happy if the TPC board approved this measure. The current paint on the stucco is aged and turned a dark murky color.

Commissioner Schoell asked if this was the original paint from when the property was first built. Mrs. Drummond said that she didn't know, but stated a new paint job with the lighter color would be similar to what is used on other English Tudor homes, and would bring out the beauty of the structure as they bring it back to its original glory.

Commissioner Snyder made a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: McBirney Mansion Easement-Paint

In Favor

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

1. Blackburn
2. Hodgson
3. Neal
4. Pounds
5. Schoell
6. Snyder
7. Turner

Request:

5. Replace the original wooden double-hung *and casement** windows on the first and second floors of the home with new, wood, aluminum clad, simulated divided light windows, with all dimensions of wooden members and all muntin patterns to match the originals. *Add two replica stained glass windows on North and East elevation in the rear of the house, in the original window openings, to provide additional privacy**. No original leaded glass or stained glass windows will be replaced.

**added conditions*

Applicant Wendy Drummond stated she did order the windows for the property already and supplied a sample for review. She noted that she did not interpret the easement that the windows were reviewable, but TPC and SHPO staff does not agree, so in the interest of cooperation she is bringing them for review. She stated that the house is full of windows and weather damage has already affected many of the areas in the house around the windows. The house has no adequate air circulation with central heat or air. Mrs. Drummond stated that she is racing to secure the house as best she can before winter arrives. The windows orders were priced and purchased at 100k and they will match the windows currently installed on the property. Everything regarding the windows will be matched: if the window currently on the property is double hung, the new window will be double hung, and so on. The only difference is that the new windows will be aluminum clad on the exterior. Chad Osgood noted that the selected factory color of the exterior aluminum cladding is very close to the color the windows are currently painted.

Mrs. Drummond stated that she would like to amend her request, to add replacement of two kitchen windows with stained glass to replicate the stained glass windows original to the home, which are found in the reading room. This was a new item brought to the meeting and per TPC board members the item was allowed to be amended into record with item # 5. Wendy Drummond stated that the purpose for the request is because the kitchen windows overlook the newer condominiums on the neighboring property, and she would like more privacy and would like to block that view. TPC board members agreed to the

terms, but stated that the windows being replaced have to match the current window opening sizes.

Roy Loman, Loman Studios, Tulsa has reviewed the project and determined that the original glass was produced in the Kokomo Opalescent Glass Factory of Kokomo, Indiana in the 1920's and is still being produced today. Mr. Loman stated that the pattern match will be exact and that the ratio of clear to non-clear and percentages of color will be similar throughout. Roy observed that the "came" or leaded sections of the window are in fact zinc and the size of the came and materiality will be consistent with existing windows.

The colors present in the existing windows are Kokomo #33 (slightly obscured clear), Kokomo Pale Amber #185, Kokomo Lighter Purple Brown #2 Kokomo # 880 Pink or Rose as well as Antique Clear. Photo Examples of the Originals to be copied as well as photos of the glass samples are attached.

Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the request *as amended to include the two new stained glass replica windows*. Commissioner Snyder seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: McBirney Mansion Easement-Windows

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Blackburn			
2. Hodgson			
3. Neal			
4. Pounds			
5. Schoell			
6. Snyder			
7. Turner			

1. COA-14-26 / 2127 E 18th Street (Yorktown)

Applicant: Dustin Moore, Owasso Fence Company

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Construct steel porch railings.

Amanda DeCort stated she wasn't able to visit the property physically to determine what railing system would actually be in place. A map and picture of the property were presented to the TPC members for better understanding on what railing the owner was requesting for his property. However, the evidence presented wasn't enough to fully understand the railing project the owner was requesting for his property. Upon further discussion TPC members decided to continue this review to a later date when the applicant could be present.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion to review the findings at a later date and have the owner submit further examples/samples of his project request was approved unanimously. Section A: Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Structures A.6, and A.6.5.

Vote: 2127 18th Street (Yorktown)

In Favor Opposed Abstaining Not Present

1. Blackburn
2. Hodgson
3. Neal
4. Pounds
5. Schoell
6. Snyder
7. Turner

2. COA-14-27 / 1020 N Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Terrie Burton

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Replace side door with Craftsman-style wood door as submitted.

Amanda DeCort presented the project pictures of the replacement door in question to the TPC members. Jim Turner asked if the door currently installed at the property was in fact, the original door. Tom Neal stated the door does look original, but without documentation on the property to review, they will proceed.

Commissioner Snyder made a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Turner seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Section A Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Structures A.3, A.3.1, A.3.3, and A.3.5.

Vote: 1020 N Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

In Favor Opposed Abstaining Not Present

1. Blackburn
2. Hodgson
3. Neal
4. Pounds
5. Schoell
6. Snyder
7. Turner

3. COA-14-28 / 1624 S Quincy Ave (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Justin Haddock

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Remove part of front porch enclosure and rebuild.

Amanda DeCort showed the property before the porch was removed and what the property currently looks like now. It was noted that the front porch was enclosed before the historic preservation zoning overlay was put in place. The original windows were used on the updated front porch enclosure. DeCort noted that the property owner claimed he didn't know he purchased the house in an HP zoning district. Commissioners discussed the project. Due to the building changes being completed prior to TPC approval, but removing some non-contributing elements and improving the appearance of the property, TPC members decided the best action would be to allow the owner to keep his property as it stood. However, the property owner would receive a letter from TPC stating any further alterations would need to be brought to the board. The letter would also stress to the owner upon sale of his property he is to notify the new owners they are purchasing a home in an HP zoning area. The letter would have the enclosing of all guidelines relating to property being remodeled in an HP zoning area.

Commissioner Blackburn made a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Section A Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Structures A.6, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3, A.6.4 and A.6.5.

In Favor

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

1. Blackburn
2. Hodgson
3. Neal
4. Schoell
5. Snyder
6. Turner

4. COA-14-29 / 12 W. Latimer Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Sean-Paul Sandoval

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Remove doors on primary façade and replace with windows according to plans submitted. Add a single door according to plans submitted.

Amanda DeCort explained the owner would like to remove the two doors on the duplex and replace them with windows. He would like to put in one single door. She presented the materials provided by the applicant, showed additional photographs and read the applicable design guidelines. She stated that the property was purchased as a duplex, and the owner was aware of the HP Zoning

when the property was purchased. However he now wishes to change the exterior as it will become a single family home.

Commissioner Neal stated that the owner can live on the premises with the current doors in place, and that other owners of converted duplexes do this. There were concerns over the application materials submitted for review, as well as the proposed windows and doors not meeting the requirements of the design guidelines. TPC members discussed continuing the application so that the owner could come in with further documentation explain his justification for the proposed changes. A COA Subcommittee review was also suggested.

Chairman Turner stated that if the board feels the proposed work does not meet the guidelines, he would prefer that the board move to deny the application. The applicant then has the option to start over with a new application and go through the COA subcommittee process as he is proposing changing character-defining features of the primary façade.

Commissioner Blackburn made a motion to deny the request. Commissioner Snyder seconded the motion. The motion to deny was approved unanimously. Section A Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Structures A.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3 and A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6 and A.4.7.

Vote: 12 W. Latimer Avenue (Brady Heights)

In Favor (to deny)

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

1. Blackburn
2. Hodgson
3. Neal
4. Schoell
5. Snyder
6. Turner

Request:

1. Replace failing cinder block retaining wall under front porch deck with engineered split faced blocks according to plans submitted in order to support foundation safety.

Amanda DeCort presented the application, showed photographs and reviewed the applicable guidelines. She stated that the owner would like to rebuild the retaining wall currently on the property, as it is deteriorating and he believes it is causing damage to the foundation. DeCort presented his application materials and showed photographs of the property. She noted that the property has a rock-faced block foundation. The owner proposed to use a modular retaining wall system to replace the current wall. Section G Guidelines for Landscape Features, Paving and Signage G.1, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4 and G.1.5.

Commissioner Schoell made a motion to deny the request. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. The motion to deny was approved unanimously.

Vote: 12 W. Latimer Avenue (Brady Heights)

In Favor (to deny)

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

1. Blackburn
2. Hodgson
3. Neal
4. Schoell
5. Snyder
6. Turner

At this point, Chairman Turner had to leave the meeting due to other commitments. Vice-Chairman Jack Hodgson took over chairing the meeting.

C. Reports

1. Staff – No report.
2. Chair – Holiday Party.
Jack Hodgson stated he would like to host the party this year.
3. Committees – No reports.

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Adjournment

Meeting was adjourned at 3:47 by Vice-Chairman Hodgson.