



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 10, 2014, 11:00 am

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Vice Chairman Hodgson called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:00 a.m.

Members Present

Jack Hodgson, Vice-Chair
David Pounds, Secretary*
David Blackburn
Susan McKee*
Tom Neal
David Schoell
Robert Shears
John Snyder
*late

Members Absent

Jim Turner, Chairman

Staff Present

Amanda DeCort, Bob Edmiston, Monty McElroy

Others Present

Lori Wilson, Joel Collins, Kat Fasano, Rick Elliott

- #### 2. Approval of Minutes from March 25, 2014. Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve Regular Minutes from March 25. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: Regular Meeting Minutes from March 25, 2014

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Blackburn	None	None	1. McKee
2. Hodgson			2. Pounds
3. Neal			
4. Schoell			
5. Shears			
6. Snyder			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No one reported a conflict of interest with the proposals on the agenda.

B. Actionable Items

1. **COA-14-08 / 1709 S. Cincinnati Place** (North Maple Ridge)
Applicant: Lori Wilson
COA Subcommittee Review Date: None
Request:
1. Replace existing non-original wood porch railings and balusters with new decorative railings according to plans submitted.
2. Replace non-original concrete steps with wooden steps according to plans submitted.

Monty McElroy presented Ms. Wilson's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines. Ms. Wilson was present to answer questions.

Applicant Lori Wilson added that many houses in Maple Ridge have concrete stairs, but on her street in the Maple Park addition, a lot of the duplexes and bungalows have wooden stairs. There's no evidence of what was there prior to the non-original pre-cast concrete now in place.

Commissioner Neal asked for clarification on the dimensions of the proposed balustrade. Ms. Wilson stated it would be built exactly as the example on Owasso Avenue (provided with the application) but scaled to fit their porch. The dimension of lumber would be the same. The top railing would be 3.5" thick and 5.5" wide.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. Vice-Chairman Hodgson asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1709 S. Cincinnati Place (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
-----------------	----------------	-------------------	--------------------

1. Blackburn	None	None	None
--------------	------	------	------

2. Hodgson

3. McKee

4. Neal

5. Pounds

6. Schoell

7. Shears

8. Snyder

The motion to approve was approved unanimously. Guideline cited: A.6.1, A.6.3, and A.6.4.

2. **COA-14-09 / 1331 E. 18th Street** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Kathleen Fasano

COA Subcommittee Review Date: March 6 and April 3, 2014

Request:

Construct concrete block retaining wall faced with manufactured stone veneer, according to plans submitted.

Monty McElroy presented Ms. Fasano's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines. Ms. Fasano and her contractor, Rick Elliott, were present to answer questions.

Commissioner Hodgson offered comments from the COA Subcommittee Report. The Subcommittee found the application complete and moved it forward to the full Commission.

Commissioner Shears discussed the structural aspects of the footings. He advised the applicant that it would be quite a process and what would likely be required from a structural engineer for permit approval.

Commissioners discussed dry stack verses grouted. The consensus was that the grouted product was more appropriate to the neighborhood rather than the dry stack. Examples were reviewed of existing grouted retaining walls.

Commissioner Blackburn recommended that the application be approved with the conditions that the wall be grouted and that it turn back to stack on top of the bulkheads at the end, as shown in the photo of the wall at 1347 E. 18th Street.

Commissioner Hodgson made a motion to approve the application with conditions. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. Vice-Chairman Hodgson asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1331 E. 18th Street (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Blackburn 2. Hodgson 3. Mckee 4. Neal 5. Pounds 6. Schoell 7. Snyder	None	1. Shears	None

The motion to approve was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: G.1.3 and G.1.6.

3. **COA-14-10 / 1814 S. Detroit Ave** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Joel Collins

COA Subcommittee Review Date: February 6, March 6 and April 3, 2014

Request:

Construct new single family house on vacant lot according to plans submitted.

Monty McElroy presented Mr. Collins' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines. Mr. Collins was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Hodgson offered comments from the COA Subcommittee Reports. The Subcommittee found the application complete and moved it forward.

Commissioner Neal stated that he felt that the applicant had made a lot of effort on the project, but he felt the design was not a good fit and out of character for the neighborhood. He said the complexity of the roofline and massing gave it more of a south Tulsa feel rather than one that fits in the middle of a historic neighborhood.

Commissioner McKee agreed with Commissioner Neal and stated that she also had issues with the attached garage and vinyl windows.

Commissioner Hodgson made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. Vice-Chairman Hodgson asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1814 S. Detroit Ave (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Blackburn	1. McKee	None	None
2. Hodgson	2. Neal		
3. Pounds			
4. Schoell			
5. Shears			
6. Snyder			

The motion to approve was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.4, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1 and C.5.2.

C. Reports

1. Staff

Amanda DeCort talked about the Annual Statewide Preservation Conference and the CAMP training program to be held June 4 - 6 on the O.U. campus in Norman, OK. She encouraged commissioners to attend.

She also mentioned that the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions annual conference is in Philadelphia this July, and said that the conference is very worthwhile. She told Commissioners she would send the information by email.

She stated that consultant Susan Kline is in town to work on the National Register Nomination for the Evans building at the Evans Fintube site.

Bob Edmiston gave an update on the PUD process for the Barnard Trace development.

2. Chair

No report

3. Committees

a) Rules and Regulations
No report

b) Outreach

Susan McKee reported that the Outreach Committee would like to have a preservation festival in May of 2015, with more details forthcoming. She asked if Commissioners would prefer "festival" or "celebration." John Snyder pointed out that you can sell more tickets to a festival.

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

F. Adjournment

Meeting was adjourned at 12:14 p.m. by Vice-Chairman Hodgson.