



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, March 25, 2014, 4:30 pm

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Turner called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:32 p.m.

Members Present

Jim Turner, Chairman
David Pounds, Secretary
David Blackburn*
Susan McKee
Tom Neal
Robert Shears
John Snyder

Members Absent

Jack Hodgson
David Schoell

Staff Present

Amanda DeCort, Bob Edmiston, Monty McElroy

Others Present

Billy Bartko, Steven Jones, Sean-Paul Sandoval, Po Yu Wang

2. Approval of Minutes from March 13, 2014. Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve Regular Minutes from March 13. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: Regular Meeting Minutes from March 13, 2014

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Blackburn	None	None	None
2. McKee			
3. Neal			
4. Pounds			

5. Shears
6. Snyder
7. Turner

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

No one reported a conflict of interest with the proposals on the agenda.

B. Actionable Items

1. **COA-14-06 / 1017 N. Cheyenne Avenue** (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Po Yu Wang

COA Subcommittee Review Date: March 6 and March 18, 2014

Request:

1. Construct addition to back of hose according to plans submitted.
2. Replace front door with new wood craftsman style front door. (installed before COA).

Monty McElroy presented Mr. Wang's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines. Mr. Wang and his contractor, Mr. Sandoval, were present to answer questions.

Commissioner Turner offered comments from the COA Subcommittee Reports. The applicant made changes based on Subcommittee recommendations. The Subcommittee found the application complete and moved it forward.

Commissioners discussed the proposal and asked questions of the applicant. There was discussion regarding the new porch and handrails on north side and reusing the original front door. Commissioners discussed the roof line on the addition and how it ties in to existing. There was discussion about offsetting the walls of the addition from the existing house and the comparison of the new brick to the original. The new windows will be wooden double-hung with limestone sills to match originals. Several Commissioners felt that conditions should be made that the new north side porch and rails be painted, and if the original front door is unusable, a new application for another alternative must be presented.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with conditions. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. Chairman Turner asked for a vote on the motion with the conditions that the proposed north side porch rails be painted to match trim on house and that if the old front door is not reused at the new north landing, the applicant would need to apply for a new COA for a different door.

Vote: 1017 N. Cheyenne (Brady Heights), with conditions

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Blackburn	None	None	None

2. Mckee
3. Neal
4. Pounds
5. Shears
6. Snyder
7. Turner

The motion to approve was approved by majority. Guideline cited: A.3.1, A.3.5, and A.3.6, B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.3.1, B.3.3, and B.4.2.

2. **COA-14-07 / 1537 S. Madison Avenue** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Billy Bartko

COA Subcommittee Review Date: March 18, 2014

Request:

1. Replace existing deteriorated wood siding, soffit and trim with HardiPlank siding to match existing dimensions and details.
2. Replace existing deteriorated columns and capitals of porch and porte-cochere with new fiberglass columns and plaster capitals to match existing.

Monty McElroy presented Mr. Bartko's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines. Mr. Bartko was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Turner offered comments from the COA Subcommittee Report. The Subcommittee found the application complete and moved it forward.

Commissioners discussed the proposal and asked questions of the applicant. There was discussion of the replacement of all the trim detail around the house. Mr. Bartko said all the trim will be wood milled to match the existing. He showed Commissioners old pieces of rotted columns and old trim along with some new matching trim that has been cut and pieced. The column substitution is very close to original with the same dimensions and tapering along with the capitals that are a very close match.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. Chairman Turner asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1537 S. Madison Avenue (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Blackburn	None	None	None

2. Mckee

3. Neal
4. Pounds
5. Shears
6. Snyder
7. Turner

The motion to approve was approved unanimously. Guideline cited: A.2.1, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.5.2, A.5.3, A.6.1, A.6.2 and A.6.3.

C. Reports

1. Staff

Amanda DeCort mentioned the storm window workshop, scheduled for March 28 through March 30. She also brought up the CLG contract.

2. Chair

No report

3. Committees

a) Rules and Regulations

No report

b) Outreach

Commissioner McKee said they were putting together a plan for 2014-2015 including identifying preservation easements. She also said they were looking at a preservation festival in 2015 which they hope to make an annual affair. She asked that any ideas for the fair and educational opportunities and ways to partner with other organizations be sent her way.

D. New Business

Attorney Bob Edmiston advised that the Barnard Trace, LLC Application for a PUD to be heard at the next TMAPC meeting was a proper item for discussion under "New Business" since neither he nor Amanda DeCort had been provided a copy of the Staff Report in time to know the matter should be included on the regular Agenda for today's meeting.

Amanda gave an overview of the PUD proposal and deemed it problematic due in part, to a portion of the residential development being positioned on interior-facing lots.

Chairman Turner commented in part that the necessity for retaining HP overlay zoning coupled with the need for input from this Commission made it appropriate for participation by the Preservation Commission at the hearing.

Several Commissioners voiced concern over the PUD at various levels and asked questions about the process.

Bob commented that although he had only scanned the Staff Report, it appeared that the role of this Commission in the Certificate of Appropriateness procedure was recognized and emphasized by the author as essential to any PUD to be approved by the Planning Commission. The Staff Report reminds the Planning Commission more than once that the site is within an HP overlay district and that Chapter 10a of the Zoning Code applies.

Amanda again pointed out the troubling nature of the unnatural orientation of certain planned houses which will not have their fronts face the street but will be positioned with their fronts facing an interior courtyard and their backs facing the street and their neighbors across the street.

The existence of the wall which has been a major focal point for the neighborhood was discussed and the possible impact the wall might play in the positioning of houses within the development.

Chairman Turner will coordinate with Amanda and plan to attend the TMAPC meeting to offer his comments from the perspective of this Commission. Other Commissioners indicated the desire to attend. Bob commented that the number of Commissioners attending cannot amount to a quorum of the membership unless Open Meeting requirements are met.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items
None

F. Adjournment
Meeting was adjourned at 5:46 p.m. by Chairman Turner.