



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, September 9, 2010, 11:00 a.m.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 E. 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

THE AGENDA FOR THIS MEETING WAS POSTED AT THE OFFICE OF THE TULSA CITY CLERK, 175 EAST SECOND ST., TULSA OKLAHOMA, IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE OPEN MEETING ACT ON SEPTEMBER 7, 2010 AT 4:35 PM.

1. **Roll Call** – Chairman Sober called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:01 a.m.

Members Present

Bob Sober, Chairman
Matt King, Vice-Chairman
Kristen Bergman, Secretary
Pamela Curtis
Charles Gilmore
Jack Hodgson
Susan McKee
Anne Pollard
Robert Shears
Barbara Smallwood
Mary Lee Townsend
Jim Turner*
Bob Winchester
Elizabeth Wright*

Members Absent

Paula Wood

Staff Present

Patrick Boulden, Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer
*Arrived late

2. **Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes of August 24, 2010**

Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for August 24, 2010. Commissioner Curtis seconded. Chairman Sober called for a vote on the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

In Favor

1. Curtis
2. Gilmore
3. Hodgson
4. King
5. McKee
6. Pollard
7. Shears
8. Smallwood
9. Sober
10. Winchester

Opposed

None

Abstaining

1. Bergman
2. Townsend

Not Present

1. Turner
2. Wright

3. Committee Reports

A. Historic Preservation Committee

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

No one responded to having a conflict of interest with any of the proposals on the agenda.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

1. 2207 E. 19th Street (Yorktown)

Applicant: Kim Camp

Request: Replace existing windows with new vinyl windows with exterior muntin grids. Muntin pattern will match existing.

Application Date: September 9, 2010

Mr. Sharrer presented Ms. Camp's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. David Walker, sales representative from Thermal Windows, was present to answer questions and brought a demonstration window for the Commission's review.

Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to deem the application complete and approve the application with no conditions.

Commissioner Pollard seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 2207 E. 19th Street, Kim Camp

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. King
6. McKee
7. Pollard
8. Shears
9. Smallwood
10. Sober
11. Townsend
12. Winchester

Opposed

None

Abstaining

1. Wright

Not Present

1. Turner

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.

Yorktown Guidelines cited: A1.2.1, A1.2.3, A1.2.4

2. **709 N. Cheyenne Avenue** (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Robert A. Burrell

Request: Replace deteriorated front porch railing, not original to house, with new wood porch railing according to plans submitted.

Application Date: September 9, 2010

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Burrell's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Burrell was not present. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deem the application complete and approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Smallwood seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 709 N. Cheyenne Avenue, Robert A. Burrell

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. King
6. McKee
7. Pollard
8. Shears
9. Smallwood
10. Sober
11. Townsend
12. Winchester
13. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

1. Turner

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Brady Heights Guidelines cited: Porches: Preferred Option, 1; Second Preference, 1

3. **1763 S. Xanthus Avenue** (Yorktown)
Applicant: Martin R. Steinmetz
Request: Install vinyl siding to gable ends on side elevations of house and gable end of enclosed front porch.
Application Date: September 9, 2010

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Steinmetz's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Steinmetz was not present. Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to deem the application complete and approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Pollard seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1763 S. Xanthus Avenue, Martin R. Steinmetz

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	1. Curtis	1. McKee	None
2. Gilmore	2. Shears	2. Townsend	
3. Hodgson		3. Turner	
4. King			
5. Pollard			
6. Smallwood			
7. Sober			
8. Winchester			
9. Wright			

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: E1.0.1 - E1.0.4, A1.1.4

B. Rules and Regulations Committee

No report.

C. Outreach Committee

Commissioner Bergman reported that the next meeting of the Committee would be Thursday, September 16 at 11:30am at Eloté. Topics of discussion will include neighborhood outreach initiatives.

D. Implementation Committee

Commissioner Smallwood, Ms. DeCort and Mr. Boulden led a discussion regarding changes to the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

a. Membership Configuration

A written proposal to reduce the number of Preservation Commissioners from 15 to 9 (with 2 non-voting ex-officio members) was distributed to the Commission for discussion. The proposal would reduce the Professional members from 7 to 5 (eliminating the Banker and Tulsa Public School seats), the Property owners from 6 to 4, and make the two ex-officio seats (Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission rep and Arts Commission rep) non-voting and not count toward quorum requirements.

Commissioner Turner expressed concerns with reducing the amount of neighborhood representation. Commissioner McKee agreed with those concerns. Commissioners Townsend and Pollard noted that property owners would be reduced by the same number as professional members and there would continue to be only one more professional member than property owners as in years past. Commissioner Winchester cautioned the Commission to ensure that its role in protecting property rights and values is considered. Commissioner Wright asked for clarification on the requirements for property owners. Commissioner Smallwood clarified that those 4 members must own property listed in or deemed eligible for the National Register of Historic Places, individually or as part of a district.

Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to approve the membership configuration proposal. Commissioner Curtis seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Membership Configuration

In Favor

- 1. Bergman
- 2. Curtis
- 3. Hodgson
- 4. King
- 5. Pollard
- 6. Shears
- 7. Smallwood
- 8. Sober
- 9. Townsend
- 10. Winchester

Opposed

- 1. McKee
- 2. Turner
- 3. Wright

Abstaining

None

Not Present

- 1. Gilmore

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.

b. Staggering of Terms

Commissioner Smallwood gave a proposal for staggering Commissioners' terms to achieve balance and continuity. When the Commission membership is reduced to 9, all members would be (re)appointed at the same time. Three would be appointed to a 1-year term; three would be appointed to a 2-year term; and three would be appointed to a 3-year term. This would ensure that no more than 1/3 of the Commission would turn over in a given year.

Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to approve the term staggering proposal. Commissioner Curtis seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Staggering of Terms

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	1. Wright	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Shears			
9. Smallwood			
10. Sober			
11. Townsend			
12. Turner			
13. Winchester			

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.

c. Term Limits

Mr. Boulden led a discussion on the proposed ordinance language limiting Commissioners to three consecutive terms (not including partial terms served), at which time the member would rotate off the Commission for one year before becoming eligible for appointment again.

Commissioner Winchester made a motion to approve the term limits proposal. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Term Limits

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. King
6. McKee
7. Pollard
8. Shears
9. Smallwood
10. Sober
11. Townsend
12. Turner
13. Winchester

Opposed

None

Abstaining

1. Wright

Not Present

None

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.

d. Quorum Requirements

Mr. Boulden led a discussion on the proposed ordinance language on quorum requirements, setting the quorum as a simple majority of all voting members (regardless of vacancies).

Commissioner Winchester made a motion to approve the quorum requirements proposal. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Quorum Requirements

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. King
6. McKee
7. Pollard
8. Shears
9. Smallwood
10. Sober
11. Townsend
12. Turner
13. Winchester

Opposed

None

Abstaining

1. Wright

Not Present

None

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.

Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to request of the appropriate governing bodies that these ordinance changes be made effective January 1, 2011. Commissioner King seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Ordinance Effective Date

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Shears			
9. Smallwood			
10. Sober			
11. Townsend			
12. Turner			
13. Winchester			
14. Wright			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

E. Enforcement Committee

No report.

4. Chair Report

- A. Authorization for the Chairman to meet with the City Council to request that the City conduct a small area plan of the area on South Utica Avenue, from 11th Street to 21st Street and at least 500 feet on each side of the center line of South Utica Avenue.**

Chairman Sober explained to the Commission why a small area plan could benefit all stakeholders along Utica Avenue, including developers, medical facilities, small business owners, and residents of the Swan Lake and Yorktown neighborhoods. The Commission discussed specific language to use in any exhibits or presentation to the Council. Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Curtis seconded the motion. Vice-Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Request Utica Avenue Small Area Plan

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Hodgson
4. King
5. McKee
6. Pollard
7. Shears
8. Smallwood
9. Sober
10. Townsend
11. Turner
12. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

1. Gilmore

Not Present

1. Winchester

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.

- B. Authorization for the Chairman to meet with the City Council to request, pursuant to Title 42 Tul.Rev.Ord. Section 1702, that the City Council direct the Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission to study and report its recommendation to the Council on text amendments to the Zoning Code addressing how to protect the boundaries of Historic Preservation Districts from encroachment of incompatible development.**

Chairman Sober explained to the Commission how the development community and Tulsa's historic districts could benefit from an analysis of the Zoning Code as it pertains to commercial properties abutting the boundaries of Historic Preservation Zoned neighborhoods. He noted that the new PLANiTULSA Comprehensive Plan calls for an update to the Zoning Code and that this study would be well timed in advance of the broader overhaul.

The Commission discussed specific language to use in any exhibits or presentation to the Council. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Turner seconded the motion. Vice-Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Request Zoning Code Study

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Hodgson
4. King
5. McKee
6. Shears
7. Smallwood
8. Sober
9. Townsend
10. Turner

Opposed

1. Gilmore
2. Pollard
3. Wright

Abstaining

None

Not Present

1. Winchester

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.

5. Absence Report

A. Excused Absence Request – Mary Lee Townsend (August 24)

Commissioner Pollard made a motion to excuse the absence of Commissioner Townsend from the August 24th meeting. Commissioner Smallwood seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. King
6. McKee
7. Pollard
8. Shears
9. Smallwood
10. Sober
11. Townsend
12. Turner
13. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

1. Winchester

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

B. Excused Absence Request – Jim Turner (August 12 and August 24)

Commissioner Pollard made a motion to excuse the absence of Commissioner Turner from the August 12th and 24th meetings. Commissioner Smallwood seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	1. Winchester
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Shears			
9. Smallwood			
10. Sober			
11. Townsend			
12. Turner			
13. Wright			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

C. Excused Absence Request – Bob Winchester (August 24)

Commissioner Wright made a motion to excuse the absence of Commissioner Winchester from the August 24th meeting. Commissioner King seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	1. Winchester
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Shears			
9. Smallwood			
10. Sober			
11. Townsend			
12. Turner			
13. Wright			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

6. Other Business

A. National Register Nomination – Oil Capital Historic District

Chairman Sober introduced Lynda Schwan, National Register of Historic Places Architectural Historian at the State Historic Preservation Office, who briefly explained the process of nominating properties to the National Register to the Commission. Cathy Ambler, Preservation Consultant, gave a presentation on the Oil Capital Historic District in downtown Tulsa.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to find the Oil Capital Historic District eligible for the National Register of Historic Places and forward the nomination to the State Historic Preservation Office. Commissioner Smallwood seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Oil Capital Historic District

In Favor

- 1. Bergman
- 2. Curtis
- 3. Gilmore
- 4. Hodgson
- 5. King
- 6. McKee
- 7. Pollard
- 8. Shears
- 9. Smallwood
- 10. Sober
- 11. Townsend
- 12. Turner

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

- 1. Winchester
- 2. Wright

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

7. New Business.

Commissioner Bergman made a request that the Commission consider reordering its Agenda items so that guests who are making presentations would appear earlier in the proceedings. She suggested that the order of business be Certificate of Appropriateness applications, presentations by guests, then Committee reports and other internal Commission business.

Commissioner Smallwood reported that intern Audra Moore is currently comparing the various neighborhood design guidelines for similarities and differences. Her study will help the Commission in improving and enhancing the design guidelines next year.

Ms. DeCort reminded the Commission of the professional development workshop on Saturday, September 18th, 10:00am – 4:00pm in City Hall. Monica Callahan, Piedmont Preservation and the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions, will lead the workshop.

Commissioner Turner encouraged the Commissioners to attend the Open House taking place later today for the 119 Downtown condo project downtown.

Commissioner Wright encouraged the Commission to look into attending the Tulsa Foundation for Architecture's Launch Party for its newly published Vintage Tulsa Neon Signs booklet. The event will take place on Tuesday, September 14, 5:00 – 7:00pm at El Rancho Grande Restaurant on old Route 66.

8. Adjournment

Chairman Sober adjourned the meeting at 12:51 p.m.

The proceedings of the Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting of September 9, 2010 were recorded. The meeting minutes were transcribed by Ed Sharrer. Minutes approved by the TPC on September 28, 2010.