



**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
OF THE
TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION**
Thursday, March 12, 2009, 11:00 a.m.
175 E. 2nd Street, 10th Floor North Conference Room
Tulsa, OK 74103

- 1. Roll Call** – Chairperson Smallwood called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:08 a.m.

Members Present:

Chair, Barbara Smallwood;
Vice-Chairman Bob Sober, Arts Commissioner;
Secretary, Paula Wood, Professional Tulsa Public Schools Rep.;
Breniss O’Neal; Community Group Resident;
Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;
Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian;
Jack Hodgson, Professional Real Estate Broker;
Matt King, Professional Architect;
Jim Turner, Community Group Resident;
Bob Winchester, Professional Banker; &
Robert Shears, Professional Landscape Architect;

Members Absent:

Kristen Bergman, Community Group Resident; (pending status) &
Elizabeth A. Wright, Planning Commissioner;

Others Present:

Patrick Boulden, Fannie Warrior, Ed Sharrer, Cathy Ambler, Glen R. Roberson, Lynda Schwan, Allison Marshalls, Ed Knell, Dana Falletti, Stephanie Arnold deVerges, & Guy deVerges.

2. Approval of Minutes of Previous Regular Meeting Minutes for February 12, 2009;

Chair Smallwood asked if anyone would like to make a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes from the last meeting.

Commissioner O'Neal made a motion to *Approve* the Regular Meeting Minutes for February 12, 2009 with a minor correction. Commissioner King seconded.

Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve the February 12, 2009 Regular Meeting Minutes:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Secretary Wood;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Breniss O'Neal;
- (6) Robert Shears; &
- (7) Matt King;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

- (8) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (9) Jim Turner;
- (10) Jack Hodgson; &
- (11) Bob Winchester;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

3. Atlas Life Building National Register Nomination Review

Preservation Consultant, Cathy Ambler, Ph.D., stated that she was thrilled to talk to the Commissioners about the Atlas Life Building. A copy of the 29-page National Register of Historic Places of the Atlas Life Building was distributed for review. Dr. Ambler asked the

Commissioners if they had not had a chance to go inside to see the Atlas Life Building, to please do so because it is a wonderful significant project.

Dr. Ambler stated that the building is going to be a tax credit project; and that it's going to be a beautiful addition to our downtown Tulsa. She added that the completion date is estimated to be around the first quarter in year 2010.

Glen Roberson from the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) in Oklahoma City introduced Lynda Schwan and Allison Marshalls to the Commission. The Commission welcomed and thanked them for coming.

Some members from the Board asked Dr. Ambler a few questions about the ongoing project; and Dr. Ambler responded accordingly. After all the questions were answered, Dr. Ambler asked the Commission to please consider approving the Atlas Life Building for the National Register Nomination.

Commissioner O'Neal made a motion to approve considering the Atlas Life Building for the National Register Nomination; and Secretary Wood seconded.

Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve considering the Atlas Life Building for National Register Nomination:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Secretary Wood;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Breniss O'Neal;
- (6) Robert Shears;
- (7) Matt King;
- (8) Jim Turner;
- (9) Jack Hodgson; &
- (10) Bob Winchester;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

- (11) Mary Lee Townsend;

The motion was ***Approved Unanimously*** by members present and voting.

4. Committee Reports

A. Historic Preservation Committee

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

Chair Smallwood asked the Commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with any of the four (4) Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) requests that have been brought before the Commission today. No one had a conflict of interest with any of the proposals.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Chair Smallwood briefly informed the COA applicants of how their proposals would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination.

1. 905 N. Cheyenne Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Tulsa Habitat for Humanity

Request: Construct new single-family house on lot according to plans submitted.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-10-2009

APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Tulsa Habitat for Humanity's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Tulsa Habitat for Humanity plans to construct a new single-family Bungalow house with no garage on the lot at 905 N. Cheyenne Avenue according to the plans that were submitted.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the property in the Brady Heights District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for this proposal under *New Construction* for the Brady Heights District.

Mr. Knell stated that Tulsa Habitat for Humanity was not a custom home builder; and that the applicant has made several changes to the home to abide by the district's guidelines. Commissioner King added that Mr. Knell has worked well with the COA Subcommittee and the modified plans are a really nice compromise.

Chair Smallwood asked Secretary Wood to please give her report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Tulsa Habitat for Humanity's application.

Secretary Wood stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Tulsa Habitat for Humanity's application to be complete at the March 10, 2009 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve* Tulsa Habitat for Humanity's proposal for *New Construction* based on the appropriate design guidelines for new construction with conditions:

- ◇ That a requirement of the front porch have a step down to the grade; and the driveway be brought in from the front to extend as far as required

Secretary Wood stated that the information that Mr. Knell has brought before the Commission today has satisfied the Board; and that she would like to make a motion to approve this new construction project with new conditions:

- ◇ That the applicant install a square gable vent above the porch

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

After further review of this application, Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Tulsa Habitat for Humanity's application with conditions:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Secretary Wood;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Breniss O'Neal;
- (6) Robert Shears;
- (7) Matt King;
- (8) Bob Winchester; &

(9) Mary Lee Townsend;

All Opposed:

(10) Jim Turner; &

(11) Jack Hodgson;

All Abstaining:

None ;

All not present during this vote:

None;

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Tulsa Habitat for Humanity's proposal based on guidelines under General Requirements, Paragraphs #1 through #4; Building Materials, Paragraph #1 & under Building Site, Paragraphs #1, #2 & #4 for New Construction or Moving Structures into the Brady Heights Historic District.

Chair Smallwood moved to COA Agenda Item #3, Dana Falletti because the applicant for COA Agenda Item #2 was unable to attend the meeting.

3. 1811 S. Quincy Avenue (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Dana Falletti

Request: Enclose side porch on south elevation of house according to plans submitted.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-10-2009

APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Dana Falletti's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Ms. Falletti plans to enclose the side porch on the south elevation of the house according to plans that were submitted.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Ms. Falletti's proposal under *Additions* for Swan Lake.

Chair Smallwood asked Secretary Wood to please give her report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Ms. Falletti's application.

Secretary Wood stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Ms. Falletti's application to be complete at the March 10, 2009 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve* Ms. Falletti's proposal for *Additions* based on the appropriate design guidelines for additions with conditions:

- ◇ That the openings between the columns be entirely glazed or entirely installed with siding

Secretary Wood stated that the information that Ms. Falletti has brought before the Commission today has satisfied the Board; and that she would like to make a motion to approve this application with new conditions:

- ◇ That the windows have a 6/1 muntin pattern with exterior grids

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

After further review of this application, Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Dana Falletti's application with conditions:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Secretary Wood;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Breniss O'Neal;
- (6) Robert Shears;
- (7) Matt King;
- (8) Jack Hodgson;
- (9) Mary Lee Townsend; &
- (10) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None ;

All not present during this vote:

Bob Winchester;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Dana Falletti's proposal based on guidelines under Section VIII B, General Requirements, B.1.0.1 through B.1.0.3; Building Materials and Elements, B.1.2.1 and B.1.2.2; and under Porches, Decks and Patios, B.1.4.1 for Additions to Existing Structures for the Swan Lake Historic District.

4. 1635 E. 17th Place (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Guy and Stephanie deVerges

Request:

- I. Widen existing 8' concrete driveway to 22' wide, poured concrete to match;
- II. Remove existing, non-original front steps and wood railing. Replace with new concrete front steps according to plans submitted;
- III. Remove existing, non-original wood railing from roof of side porch on west elevation of house; &
- V. Replace existing deteriorated 6/6 wood windows with new 6/6 clad wood windows.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-10-2009

APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS (Part 1 of 5 PARTS) &

APPROVAL WITH NO CONDITIONS (Parts 2, 3, & 5 of 5 PARTS)

Mr. Sharrer presented Parts 1, 2, 3 & 5 of 5 Parts of Guy and Stephanie deVerges' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that the deVergeses plan to (Part 1) widen the existing 8 foot concrete driveway to a 22 foot wide driveway with poured concrete to match; (Part 2) remove the existing, non-original front steps and wood railing; and replace it with new concrete front steps according to the plans that were submitted;

(Part 3) remove the existing, non-original wood railing from the roof of the side porch on the west elevation of the structure; &

(Part 5) replace the existing deteriorated 6/6 wood windows with new 6/6 clad wood windows.

Photographs and drawings were available for review on Parts 1, 2, 3 & 5 and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Parts 1, 2, 3 & 5 of the deVerges' proposal under *Additions & Rehabilitation* for Swan Lake.

The deVergeses answered questions that were asked of them by the Commission; and the Commission complimented the deVergeses on their proposal.

Chair Smallwood asked Secretary Wood to please give her report of the recommendations from the COA Subcommittee on Parts 1, 2, 3 & 5 of the deVerges' application.

Secretary Wood stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Parts 1, 2, 3 & 5 of the deVerges' application to be complete at the March 10, 2009 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve Parts 1, 2, 3 & 5* of the deVerges' proposal for *Additions & Rehabilitation* based on the appropriate design guidelines with no conditions.

After further review on Parts 1, 2, 3 & 5 of this application, Secretary Wood made a motion to approve Part 1 of 5 Parts of this application with conditions:

- ◇ To remove the existing driveway

and to approve Parts 2, 3 & 5 of 5 Parts with no conditions.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Part 1 with conditions and Parts 2, 3, & 5 with no conditions on Guy & Stephanie deVerges' application:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;

- (3) Secretary Wood;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Breniss O'Neal;
- (6) Robert Shears;
- (7) Matt King;
- (8) Jack Hodgson;
- (9) Mary Lee Townsend; &
- (10) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None ;

All not present during this vote:

Bob Winchester;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Parts 1, 2, 3 & 5 of 5 Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' proposal based on guidelines under Section VIII B, Building Site, B.1.1.2; General Requirements A.1.0.1 & Porches, Decks and Patios, A.1.4.1 & A.1.4.2; and under Windows & Doors, A.1.2.1, A.1.2.3 & A.1.2.4 for Additions and Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings/Structures for the Swan Lake Historic District.

4. 1635 E. 17th Place (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Guy and Stephanie deVerges

Request:

- IV. Install 4' tall double loop ornamental wire fence around perimeter of property according to plans submitted.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-10-2009

APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS (Part 4 of 5 PARTS)

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 4 of 5 Parts of Guy and Stephanie deVerges' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that the deVergeses plan to (Part 4) install a

4 foot tall double loop ornamental wire fence around the perimeter of the property according to plans that they had submitted.

Photographs and drawings were available for review on Part 4 and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Part 4 of the deVerges' proposal under *New Construction* for Swan Lake.

The deVergeses answered questions that were asked of them by the Commission; and the Commission complimented the deVergeses on their proposal.

Chair Smallwood asked Secretary Wood to please give her report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Part 4 of the deVerges' application.

Secretary Wood stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 4 of the deVerges' application to be complete at the March 10, 2009 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve Part 4* of the deVerges' proposal for *New Construction* based on the appropriate design guidelines with no conditions.

After further review on Part 4 of this application, Secretary Wood made a motion to approve Part 4 of 5 Parts of this application with conditions:

- ◇ That the gate be constructed of the same wire material as the fence

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Part 4 of 5 Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' application with conditions:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Secretary Wood;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Breniss O'Neal;
- (6) Robert Shears;
- (7) Matt King;
- (8) Jack Hodgson;

(9) Mary Lee Townsend; &
(10) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None ;

All not present during this vote:

Bob Winchester;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 4 of 5 Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' proposal based on guidelines under Section VIII C, Building Site C.1.1.5 for New Construction for the Swan Lake Historic District.

Chair Smallwood moved back to COA Agenda Item # 2, Philip and Nancy Lile.

2. 1531 E. 20th Street (Swan Lake)

Applicants: Philip and Nancy Lile

Request:

- I. Remove existing vinyl siding and replace with new cementitious siding.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-10-2009

APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 1 of 2 Parts of Philip and Nancy Lile's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that the Liles plan to (Part 1) remove the existing vinyl siding from the structure and replace it with a new cementitious siding.

Photographs and drawings were available for review on Part 1 and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Part 1 of the Lile's proposal under *Rehabilitation* for Swan Lake.

Chair Smallwood asked Secretary Wood to please give her report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Part 1 of the Lile's application.

Secretary Wood stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 1 of the Lile's application to be complete at the March 10, 2009 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve Part 1* of the Lile's proposal for *Rehabilitation* based on the appropriate design guidelines with no conditions:

After further review on Part 1 of this application, Secretary Wood made a motion to approve Part 1 of 2 Parts of this application with conditions:

- ◇ That the applicant(s) match the existing trim and reveal

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Part 1 of 2 Parts of Philip and Nancy Lile's application with conditions:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Secretary Wood;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Breniss O'Neal;
- (6) Robert Shears;
- (7) Matt King;
- (8) Jack Hodgson;
- (9) Mary Lee Townsend; &
- (10) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None ;

All not present during this vote:

Bob Winchester;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 1 of 2 Parts of Philip & Nancy Lile's proposal based on guidelines under Section VIIIA, Building Wall Materials, A.1.1.2 & A.1.1.4 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District.

2. 1531 E. 20th Street (Swan Lake)

Applicants: Philip and Nancy Lile

Request:

II. Replace existing 1/1 wood windows with new 1/1 vinyl windows.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-10-2009

APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 2 of 2 Parts of Philip and Nancy Lile's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that the Liles plan to (Part 2) replace the existing 1/1 wood windows on the structure with new 1/1 vinyl windows. Mr. Sharrer added that the wood windows on the house aren't the original windows.

Photographs and drawings were available for review on Part 1 and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Part 2 of the Lile's proposal under *Rehabilitation* for Swan Lake.

Chair Smallwood asked Secretary Wood to please give her report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Part 2 of the Lile's application.

Secretary Wood stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 2 of the Lile's application to be complete at the March 10, 2009 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to *Deny Part 2* of the Lile's proposal for *Rehabilitation* based on the appropriate design guidelines.

Secretary Wood stated that the Subcommittee believed that this was such a wonderful house in Swan Lake that it preferred wood windows should be installed.

After further review on Part 2 of this application, Secretary Wood made a motion to *deny Part 2* of 2 Parts of this application but the motion *failed*.

Secretary Wood made another motion to *approve Part 2* with the following conditions:

- ◇ That the applicant(s) maintain the existing casing around the windows

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O’Neal.

Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all “In Favor” of the motion to Approve Part 2 of 2 Parts of Philip and Nancy Lile’s application with conditions:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Secretary Wood;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Breniss O’Neal;
- (6) Robert Shears;
- (7) Matt King;
- (8) Jack Hodgson;
- (9) Mary Lee Townsend; &
- (10) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None ;

All not present during this vote:

Bob Winchester;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 2 of 2 Parts of Philip & Nancy Lile’s proposal based on guidelines under Section VIIIA, Windows and Doors, A.1.2.1, A.1.2.3 & A.1.2.4 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District.

B. Rules & Regulations Committee

Rules & Regulations Committee Chairman Charles Gilmore had no report.

C. Outreach Committee

Chair Smallwood reported that Outreach Committee Chairperson Kristen Bergman was in Dallas attending a Special Realtor Training Session for Historic House Specialist; and that she was unable to attend the meeting.

6. Chair Report

Chair Smallwood had no report.

7. Staff Report

The March Staff Report was distributed to the Commission prior to this meeting by email.

8. Absence Report

None.

9. New Business

None.

Under the Open Meeting Act, this agenda item is authorized only for matters not known about or which could not have been reasonably foreseen prior to the time of posting the agenda or any revised agenda.

10. Other Business

None.

This agenda item is reserved for public comment or presentations to the TPC.

11. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairperson Smallwood adjourned the meeting at 1:45 p.m. The Regular Tulsa Preservation Commission Meeting of March 12, 2009 was recorded; and the Meeting Minutes for this meeting were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

Note: Please notify Mrs. Warrior by e-mail at Fwarrior@ci.tulsa.ok.us that you have received the information forwarded to you. Project plans will be available at the Planning Department office for review.

*K:/Planning/FW/MINS 03 12 2009R TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on 04 09 2009*