



REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
OF THE

TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Thursday, August 9, 2007, 11:00 a.m.

111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820

1. **Roll Call** – Chairman Turner called the regular meeting to order at 11:10 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

Members Present:

Chairman, Jim Turner;
Vice-Chairperson, Breniss O’Neal, Professional Landscape Designer;
Secretary, Barbara Smallwood;
Michelle Cantrell, Planning Commissioner;
Dusty Peck, Community Group Resident;
Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;
Herb Fritz, Professional Architect;
Rex Ball, Community Group Resident;
Alice Rodgers, Owner, Non-residential Representative;
Kristen Bergman, Community Group Resident;
Bill Andoe, Arts Commissioner; &
Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian.

Member(s) Absent:

Bob Winchester, Professional Banker; &
Jack Hodgson, Professional Real Estate Broker.

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer, Fannie Warrior, Kurt Ackermann, Wes Byrd, Karilyn Kelson, Steve & Sarah Poleman, & David Breed.

2. Approval of Meeting Minutes for July 12, 2007

Chairman Turner asked if there was a motion on the floor to approve the Regular meeting minutes for July 12, 2007.

Commissioner Cantrell made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes of July 12, 2007, as presented. Secretary Smallwood seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Regular Meeting Minutes for July 12, 2007:

Chairman Turner – Abstain;

Vice-Chairperson O’Neal – Aye;

Secretary Smallwood – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Abstain;

Dusty Peck – Aye; &

Alice Rodgers – Was not present during this vote.

The motion was **Approved by Majority by members present and voting.**

3. Unfinished Business

a. COA Subcommittee Report

i. Announcement of Conflicts of Interest

Chairman Turner asked the Commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with any of the Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Requests that would be brought before the board for review. No one responded to having a conflict of interest with any of the proposals.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Chairman Turner briefly informed the COA applicants of the COA processing procedures of how their proposals would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination.

1. 2207 E. 18th Street (Yorktown)

Applicant: Karilyn & John Kelson

Request: Replace wood lap siding and soffit boards with fiber cement lap siding and soffit boards to match the existing dimensions, detailing and directional orientation.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application

Date: August 7, 2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Karilyn & John Kelson's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown about the historic home in the Yorktown neighborhood district.

Mr. Sharrer stated that the Kelsons plan to replace the wood lap siding and soffit boards on the structure with fiber cement lap siding and soffit boards. He stated that the Kelsons will also match the existing dimensions, detailing and directional orientation.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Rehabilitation in Yorktown*.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. Kelson if she had anything to add to Mr. Sharrer's presentation. Ms. Kelson stated that she first wanted to compliment Tulsa Preservation Commission on how great it works; and how well Mr. Sharrer presented their proposal to the Commission. She questioned the Commission as to why a COA Subcommittee member voted against their proposal to replace the wood lap siding and soffit boards. Vice-Chairperson O'Neal responded to Ms. Kelson's question stating that the COA Subcommittee member voted against their proposal because the Subcommittee member believes that the wood could be repaired.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report of the recommendation that was made on this proposal during the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered the Kelson's application to be complete after being reviewed at the August 7, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to approve the Kelson's proposal for *Rehabilitation* in the Yorktown Historic District based on the appropriate guidelines.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for a motion to be made. Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve the Kelson's application as presented. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion, comments and/or for any questions it may have. Commissioner Townsend complimented Ms. Kelson for the great job that she is proposing to do on her home.

Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Karilyn & John Kelson's application w/o conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Karilyn & John Kelson's proposal based on guidelines for Building Wall Materials, A.1.1.1, A.1.1.2 & A1.1.4 for Rehabilitation of Existing Residential Buildings for the Yorktown Historic District.

2. 1755 S. St. Louis Avenue (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Stephen & Sarah Poleman

Request:

- 1) Remove existing vinyl siding and replace with hardiplank siding matching the original siding pattern, dimensions, and directional orientation**

COA Subcommittee Complete Application

Date: August 7, 2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 1 of 3 parts of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown about the historic home in the Swan Lake neighborhood district.

Mr. Sharrer stated that the Polemans plan to remove the vinyl siding from the structure and replace it with hardiplank siding that will have a wood grain texture. He stated that the hardiplank siding will match the original siding pattern, dimensions, and directional orientation of the structure.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines for Part 1 of this proposal for *Rehabilitation in Swan Lake*.

The Commission was concerned about the material underneath the vinyl siding; and asked the Polemans if they knew what type of material was underneath the vinyl siding. The Polemans stated that they did not know what was under the vinyl siding; and that they would not know until it was removed.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report of the recommendation that was made on Part 1 of this proposal during the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 1 of the Poleman's application to be complete after being reviewed at the August 7, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to approve the Poleman's proposal for *Rehabilitation* in the Swan Lake Historic District based on the appropriate guidelines.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for a motion to be made. Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve Part 1 of the Poleman's application with the following conditions:

- ✚ If during demolition, the applicants find evidence of the original siding, the applicants have the option to match those materials exactly or in hardiplank with staff approval.

Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion, comments and/or for any questions it may have. Hearing none, Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Part 1 of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's application w/conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 1 of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's proposal based on guidelines for Building Wall Materials, A.1.1.1, A.1.1.2 & A1.1.4 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District.

2. 1755 S. St. Louis Avenue (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Stephen & Sarah Poleman

Request:

2) Remove existing original 6 over 6 wood windows and replace with new 3 over 1 wood windows

COA Subcommittee Complete Application

Date: August 7, 2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 2 of 3 parts of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown about the historic home in the Swan Lake neighborhood district.

Mr. Sharrer stated that the Polemans plan to remove the existing original 6 over 6 wood windows and replace them with new 3 over 1 aluminum-clad windows. He added that in September 1, 1998, the Commission approved a Certificate of Appropriateness request for 3 over 1 wood windows that were installed on the rear addition of this structure.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines for Part 2 of this proposal for *Rehabilitation in Swan Lake*.

Chairman Turner asked the Polemans if they had anything to add. Mr. Poleman stated that he believes that the Commission has put them in an awkward position. He stated that the Commission had already approved the proposal to have the 3 over 1 wood windows installed in 1998; and now that they're wanting to replace the 6 over 6 with the 3 over 1 windows that the Subcommittee has denied their proposal.

Chairman Turner asked the Polemans if they lived in this house when the 3 over 1 wood windows were approved originally. The Polemans responded by stating that they did. Chairman Turner asked the Polemans what was their reason for requesting to have 3 over 1 windows on the back of their home when they had 6 over 6 windows in the front. Mr. Poleman responded by stating that it was just their preference of doing so.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report of the recommendation that was made on Part 2 of this proposal during the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 2 of the Poleman's application to be complete

after being reviewed at the August 7, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee appreciated Mr. Poleman's comments; and that the Subcommittee could not presume to know the thought process that the Commission had in 1998 when the Commission approved the 3 over 1 wood windows for the new addition. Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the Subcommittee kept going back to the specific guideline under Windows & Doors, A.1.2.1 stating that the existing windows should be retained through repair when reasonably possible. She added that staff has inspected the windows and that staff has reported to the Commission that the windows are reasonably possible for repair.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the Subcommittee believed that since the 6 over 6 windows were original to the home that the Subcommittee was between a rock and a hard spot; but that they had to abide by the guidelines. She reported that the Subcommittee recommended to deny Part 2 of the Poleman's proposal for *Rehabilitation* in the Swan Lake Historic District based on the appropriate guidelines; and that she so moved. This motion failed due to the lack of a *second*.

Chairman Turner asked staff if there were any conditions made to the 1998 approval of this Certificate of Appropriateness on the 3 over 1 windows. Staff responded by stating that there were no conditions made on this request.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion, comments and/or for any questions it may have.

Mr. Poleman proposed a compromise. It was noted that the proposed compromise would allow the front façade's windows to remain intact, while the rear façade would match the 3-over-1 jailhouse pattern used in the addition.

After discussing this matter in further detail, the Commission decided to overturn the COA Subcommittee's recommendation of denial; and approve Part 2 of the Poleman's application with conditions.

Commissioner Cantrell made a motion to approve Part 2 of the Poleman's proposal with the following conditions:

- ✚ Part 2a: That the applicants can replace a total of five (5) windows to 3 over 1 wood windows: two (2) windows on the Northeast corner and three (3) windows on the East elevation of the structure.

Commissioner Ball seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Part 2a of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's application w/conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 2a of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's proposal based on guidelines for Windows & Doors, A.1.2.1, A.1.2.3 & A1.2.4 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District.

Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to approve Part 2 of the Poleman's application by adding another condition to Part 2 of this proposal.

- ✚ Part 2b: That the applicants can replace the remaining existing windows on the North and West elevations of the structure with windows matching the original muntin patterns and spacing.

Commissioner Smallwood seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Part 2b Stephen & Sarah Poleman's application w/conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 2b of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's proposal based on guidelines for Windows & Doors, A.1.2.1, A.1.2.3 & A1.2.4 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District.

Commissioner Ball would like to meeting minutes records to show that "this is not setting a precedent."

2. 1755 S. St. Louis Avenue (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Stephen & Sarah Poleman

Request:

3) Install cupola on ridgeline of roof above attached two-car garage.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application

Date: August 7, 2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 3 of 3 parts of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown about the historic home in the Swan Lake neighborhood district.

Mr. Sharrer stated that the Polemans plan to install a cupola on the ridgeline of the roof above the attached two-car garage.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines for Part 3 of this proposal for *Additions in Swan Lake*.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report of the recommendation that was made on Part 3 of this proposal during the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 3 of the Poleman's application to be complete

after being reviewed at the August 7, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to approve Part 3 of the Poleman's proposal for *Additions* in the Swan Lake Historic District based on the appropriate guidelines.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for a motion to be made. Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve Part 3 of the Poleman's application with the following conditions:

- ✚ That the applicants have the option to use a cupola matching the design submitted with the addition of a weather vane in lieu of the simple pointed rod.

Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion, comments and/or for any questions it may have. Hearing none, Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Part 3 of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's application w/conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 3 of Stephen & Sarah Poleman's proposal based on guidelines for Roofs, B1.3.1 for Additions to Existing Structures for the Swan Lake Historic District.

**3. 1603 S. Rockford Avenue (Swan Lake)
Applicant: Wes Byrd
Request: Add porch column to west side of front porch and railing to west and north sides of front porch. New column will match existing columns in width, detailing and materials. Railing will be constructed of wood according to plans submitted.
COA Subcommittee Complete Application
Date: August 7, 2007**

Mr. Sharrer presented Wes Byrd's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown about the historic home in the Swan Lake neighborhood district.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Byrd plans to add a porch column to the west side of the front porch and railing that is located on the west and north sides of front porch. He stated that Mr. Byrd also plans to install a new column that will match the existing columns in width, detailing and materials. Mr. Sharrer added that the railing will be constructed of wood.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Rehabilitation in Swan Lake*.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report of the recommendation that was made on this proposal during the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Byrd's application to be complete after being reviewed at the August 7, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to approve Mr. Byrd's proposal for *Rehabilitation* in the Swan Lake Historic District based on the appropriate guidelines.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for a motion to be made. Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve Mr. Byrd's application as presented. Commissioner Ball seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion, comments and/or for any questions it may have. Hearing none, Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Wes Byrd's application w/o conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Wes Byrd's proposal based on guidelines for General Requirements, A.1.0.1, A.1.0.2; and for Porches, Decks and Patios, A1.4.1 & A1.4.2 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District.

b. Rules & Regulations Committee

Committee Chairman, Charles Gilmore reported that the Rules & Regulations Committee will be meeting on Wednesday, August 15, 2007 at 3:00 p.m., at the Hartford Building. He asked the committee members to please try to make every effort to attend.

c. Program Planning & Neighborhood Conservation –

Outreach Committee member, Kristen Bergman distributed a 2-page report about Tulsa Preservation Commission's goal and key

messages. She asked the Commission to please review the report; and to email Ms. DeCort if anyone wanted to make some changes to the report.

Outreach Committee Chairman, Rex Ball asked Vice Chairperson O'Neal for permission to work directly with our attorney, Kurt Ackermann on the preparation of the Resolution. Vice Chairperson O'Neal granted Commissioner Ball his request.

4. Staff Report

1. TCC College for Young Scholars Architecture Class

Ms. DeCort reported that she and Mr. Sharrer gave a two-hour presentation at Tulsa Community College for young scholars on July 17, 2007. She stated that the presentation was presented to (13) thirteen young scholars who were all boys, ages 11 and 12 years old from the Architecture Class for the gifted. Ms. DeCort stated that they had a nice time; and that the boys had great questions.

2. State Historic Preservation Review Committee 7/19 meeting;

Ms. DeCort reported that the State Historic Preservation Review Committee unanimously approved the four (4) districts and Will Rogers High School Nominations on July 19, 2007.

3. Historic Resource Guide progress report

Ms. DeCort reported that a draft of the Historic Resource Guide was delivered to the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) on July 19, 2007.

4. Cataloging Project

Ms. DeCort reported that the cataloging project is continuing to process, sort, and organize photos including Will Rogers High School, Maple Ridge photos (1999), and Lortondale survey photos.

5. Streamline Art Deco Nominations status

Ms. DeCort reported that (4) four buildings are in the process of being reviewed by SHPO for Streamline Art Deco Nominations. She stated that the (4) buildings are:

-  The City Veterinary Clinic;
-  Tulsa Monument Company;
-  Hawks Dairy; &
-  The Mayo Motor Inn.

Ms. DeCort reported that a consultant has begun work; property owners have been notified; the product should be finished by September, 2007; and that SHPO will review the (4) four nominations by the end of the year.

6. Ranch Acres National Register Nomination progress

Ms. DeCort reported that the consultant has completed a draft and the photography on Ranch Acres. She stated that the draft and photography work has been given to her and to SHPO for review. Ms. DeCort stated that they expect to have the finished product by September or October, 2007.

7. Preserve America progress report

Ms. DeCort reported that they are working through the application process for Preserve America; and that they are soliciting letters of recommendation and a Mayor's Office resolution.

8. Will Rogers High School

Ms. DeCort reported that a Will Rogers staff member asked her to write them a letter stating that the building is historic, so that they may use the existing building code's historic structures provisions.

9. Various contracts, applications, amendments, etc.

Ms. DeCort reported that she has been revising and updating various contracts, applications and amendments. To name a few:

- ✚ 2006 application updated;
- ✚ 2006 contract revised;
- ✚ 2007 application completed;
- ✚ 2007 budget revision in process – new funds; &
- ✚ Upcoming Mt. Zion Church.

5. Chair Report

Chairman Turner did not have any information to report.

6. Absence Report

None.

7. Communications

David Breed, Liaison for Southwest Tulsa Historic Society stated that they're reached a point where the steam locomotive will be moved on Route 66 site. He stated they have already purchased the property where the steam locomotive will be moved to.

8. New Business

Commissioner Ball announced that the Downtown Survey has been in question as to when the survey will be conducted. He stated that they're

trying to find the resources to conduct the survey of an estimate of \$60,000.00 that is needed; but that they have been unable to find the resources at this time.

9. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairman Turner adjourned the meeting at 12:55 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of August 9, 2007 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

*K:/Planning/FW/MINS 08 09 2007R TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on 09-13-2007*