



REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
OF THE

TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Thursday, February 8, 2007, 11:00 A.M.

111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820

1. **Roll Call** - Chairman Turner called the regular meeting to order at 11:13 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

Members Present:

Chairman, James Turner; Vice-Chairperson, Breniss O'Neal; Secretary, Barbara Smallwood; Charles Gilmore; Mary Lee Townsend; Rex Ball; Michelle Cantrell; Dusty Peck; Alice Rodgers; & Kristen Bergman;

Member(s) Absent:

Herb Fritz; Jack Hodgson; Bill Andoe; Bob Winchester & Karen Rogers;

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort; Fannie Warrior; Kurt Ackermann; Ed Sharrer; Mark Radzinski; Howard Carpenter; Richard Ducey; Sam Joyner; Deborah Rainey; Susan McKee; David Breed; Neal Kennedy; Steve Olsen; Lynn Jones; Jim Medill; Cherie Cook; John Duvall & Melissa Cooper.

2. **Approval of Meeting Minutes: Regular Meeting Minutes from January 11, 2007 as amended.**

Chairman Turner asked if there was a motion on the floor to approve the meeting minutes from last month.

Commissioner Ball made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes from January 11, 2007, as amended. Commissioner Smallwood seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Meeting Minutes from January 11, 2007:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
V-Chairperson O’Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Abstain;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers - Aye.

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

3. Unfinished Business

A. Historic Preservation Committee Report

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

Chairman Turner asked the commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with any of the Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Requests that would be brought before the board for review. No one responded to having a conflict.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Chairman Turner briefly informed the COA applicants of the COA processing procedures of how their proposals would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Sharrer to please give his presentation on the first COA agenda item.

1. 619 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Jessica Rainey

Request: Install clear-view storm door at front entrance. Storm door would have oil-rubbed bronze hardware to match existing front door.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

02-06-2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Jessica Rainey’s Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in Brady Heights.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Ms. Rainey plans to install a clear-view storm door at the front entrance of the home; and that the storm door would have oil-rubbed bronze hardware to match the existing front door. Mr. Sharrer stated that the full view storm door that Ms. Rainey plans to install is a Pella Select Storm Door, Model #6000. Mr. Sharrer read aloud the appropriate guidelines for *Restoring Existing Structures* for the Brady Heights district.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. Rainey if she had any comments to make or had any information to add to Mr. Sharrer's presentation. Ms. Rainey stated that she did not; but that she would answer any questions that the Commission may have.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report on the recommendations that were made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Ms. Rainey's application to be complete at the February 6, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to approve Ms. Rainey's application for *restoring existing structures* in the Brady Heights Historic District.

V-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendations to approve Ms. Rainey's application. Commissioner Ball seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion. After a brief discussion took place, Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Ms. Rainey's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Secretary Smallwood – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Dusty Peck – Aye; &

Alice Rodgers - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously by members present and voting.**

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Jessica Rainey's proposal based on Windows & Doors, Accessories, Paragraph 2; for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Sharrer to please give his presentation on the next COA agenda item.

2. 1707 S. Rockford Ave. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Richard Ducey

Request:

- I. Remove one pair of original double-hung, nine-over-one wood windows on north side of house. Replace with one (1) double-hung, nine-over-one wood window trimmed out with salvaged original trim. Siding will be patched to match; &
- II. Remove one pair of original double-hung, one-over-one wood windows on far northeast side of house minimally visible from street. Replace with one (1) double-hung, one-over-one wood window trimmed out with salvaged original trim. Siding will be patched to match.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:
02-06-2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Parts I & II of Richard Ducey's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the c. 1922 Bungalow home in Swan Lake.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Ducey plans to remove one pair of the original double-hung, nine-over-one wood windows on the north side of the structure. He plans to replace with one (1) double-hung, nine-over-one wood window trimmed out with salvaged original trim; and that the siding will be patched to match. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Ducey also plan to remove one pair of the original double-hung, one-over-one wood windows on the far northeast side of the structure minimally visible from the street; replace it with one (1) double-hung, one-over-one wood window trimmed out with salvaged original trim; and the siding will be patched to match.

Mr. Sharrer read aloud the appropriate guidelines for *Rehabilitation for Buildings* for the Swan Lake district.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Ducey if he had any comments to make or had any information to add to Mr. Sharrer's presentation. Mr. Ducey stated that he did not; but that he would answer any questions that the Commission may have.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report on the recommendations that were made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Ducey's application to be complete at the February 6, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to approve Mr. Ducey's application for *rehabilitation of buildings* in the Swan Lake Historic District.

V-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendations to approve Mr. Ducey's application. Commissioner Ball seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion. After a discussion took place, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve both parts of Mr. Ducey's application with the following conditions:

Option 1 – To replace the installed casement windows with double hung windows with muntins; or

Option 2 – That the applicant retains the existing casement windows adding the exterior muntins in a 6-over-1 pattern.

Commissioner Ball seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Mr. Ducey's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Secretary Smallwood – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Dusty Peck – Aye; &

Alice Rodgers - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Richard Ducey's proposal based on Building Wall Materials, A.1.1.2 & Windows & Doors, A.1.2.1 thru A.1.2.4 for Rehabilitation of Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Sharrer to please give his presentation on the next COA agenda item.

3. **1507/1509 S. Gillette Ave.** (Gillette)

Applicant: Howard Carpenter

Request: Construct gabled portico over the front entrance of 1507 unit. Gable end material will be stucco with half-timbering trim details to match main house. Roof pitch, shingles and eave materials will match the main house.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 02-06-2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Howard Carpenter's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the c. 1922 historic duplex in Gillette.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Carpenter plans to construct a gabled portico over the front entrance of unit 1507; and the gable end material will be stucco with half-timbering trim details to match the main house. He stated that the roof pitch, shingles and eave materials will match the main house.

Mr. Sharrer read aloud the appropriate guidelines for *Additions to Existing Structures* for the Gillette district.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Carpenter if he had any comments to make or had any information to add to Mr. Sharrer's presentation. Mr. Carpenter stated that he did not; but that he would answer any questions that the Commission may have.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report on the recommendations that were made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Carpenter's application to be complete at the February 6, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to approve Mr. Carpenter's application (with conditions) for *additions to existing structures* in the Gillette Historic District.

V-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the Subcommittee had recommended to approve Mr. Carpenter's application with conditions; but that staff has added the Subcommittee's conditions in with the applicant's original request.

Chairman Turner asked staff to please leave the application request as it stands; and allow the COA Subcommittee to make conditions to the proposal in the COA report.

V-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve Mr. Carpenter's application with no conditions. Commissioner Gilmore seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion. After a brief discussion took place, Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Mr. Carpenter's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Howard Carpenter's proposal based on General Requirements, 2.0.2 & 2.0.3; from Building Materials & Elements, 2.2.1 & 2.2.2; and from Roofs, 2.3.2 for Additions to Existing Structures in the Gillette Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Sharrer to please give his presentation on the next COA agenda item.

4. **319 E. 18th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Steve Olsen

Request:

- I. Construct a 155 square foot, one-story addition to east elevation of house. Addition will be a half-octagon with a hipped roof of asphalt shingles, stucco walls, and divided-light wood windows on all sides; &
- II. Construct a 512 square foot, one-story addition to north elevation of house. Addition will be rectangular with a hipped roof of asphalt shingles, stucco walls, and wood windows with 9-light Prairie muntin pattern to match existing house. Addition will have a pair of clear-view exterior French doors and wood stairs on east side for access to back yard.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:
02-06-2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Parts I & II of Steve Olsen's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in North Maple Ridge.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Olsen plans to construct a 155 square foot, one-story addition to the east elevation of the structure. The new addition will be a half-octagon with a hipped roof of asphalt shingles, stucco walls, and divided-light wood windows on all sides. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Olsen plans to construct a 512 square foot, one-story addition to the north elevation of the structure. This new addition will be rectangular with a hipped roof of asphalt shingles, stucco walls, and wood windows with a 9-light Prairie muntin pattern to match the existing house. Mr. Sharrer stated that this addition will have a pair of clear-view exterior French doors and wood stairs on the east side of the addition for access to the back yard.

Mr. Sharrer read aloud the appropriate guidelines for *Additions to Existing Structures* for the Swan Lake district.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Olsen if he had any comments to make or had any information to add to Mr. Sharrer's presentation. Mr. Olsen stated that he did not; but that he would answer any questions that the Commission may have.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report on the recommendations that were made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Olsen's application to be complete at the February 6, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to approve both parts of Mr. Olsen's application for *additions to existing structures* in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

V-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendations to approve Mr. Olsen's application with the following conditions:

- ◇ For Part I – That the applicant install True Divided Light (TDL) windows; a copper roof on east addition; and install gutters to match the existing;
- ◇ For Part II – That the applicant installs gutters to match the existing.

Commissioner Gilmore seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion. After a discussion took place, Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Mr. Olsen’s application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
V-Chairperson O’Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously by members present and voting.**

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Steve Olsen’s proposal based on General Requirements, B.1.0.1 thru B.1.0.3 & Building Materials and Elements, B.1.2.1 & B.1.2.2 for Additions to Existing Structures for the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Sharrer to please give his presentation on the next COA agenda item.

5. **2007 S. Yorktown Ave.** (Yorktown)
Applicant: Brian Sachse
Request: Demolition of existing structure at 2007 S. Yorktown Avenue.
COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 02-06-2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Brian Sachse’s Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the c. 1922 Bungalow historic home in Yorktown.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Sachse plans to demolish the existing structure at 2007 S. Yorktown Avenue. He stated that the structure was purchased last month in January, 2007; and that there was a fire in the basement that damaged the house a few years ago. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Sachse believes that due to the fire damage and due to its poor condition that the house is in, that he had purchased this house just for demolition.

Mr. Sharrer read aloud the appropriate guidelines for *Demolition of Residential Structures* for the Yorktown district. He stated “that

Structures should first be rehabilitated, modified, or altered to achieve a continued, useful state, when reasonably possible. Demolition should be utilized only upon determining that the use of the property cannot be achieved through the above methods.” Mr. Sharrer read guidelines from the City of Tulsa Ordinance, Chapter 10A, Historic Preservation, Section 1055D, *Applications Involving Demolition – Stay*, is #1: Imminently dangerous to life and property.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Duvall if he had any comments to make or had any information to add to Mr. Sharrer’s presentation. Mr. Duvall, representing Brian Sachse’s proposal for demolition stated that he did have a few comments to make. Mr. Duvall stated that the house was purchased for demolition due to the home deterioration from fire damage, wood rot, termite problems, etc., that he believes that this house should be demolished.

Mr. Duvall stated that the Sachse’s house was inspected on October 9, 2006 for structural, roof, & sub-grade moisture infiltration by Knox Inspection Services, Inc. He stated that the opinions made by Knox Inspection Services, Inc., on the conditions of the structure were that the damage occurring in the wood-rot columns, distressed porch slab, burnt timbers in the basement, bulging basement wall, wood-rot outside rafters, fascia boards and siding should be considered structural defects. Mr. Duvall distributed a report to the Commission on the conditions of the Sachse’s house from Duvall Architects. The report stated that repairs needed to remedy the conditions and return the property to a useful state are extensive and would require such extensive demolition to both the interior and exterior that the applicant and Duvall Architects are asking the Commission for approval of demolition of the structure.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O’Neal to please give her report on the recommendations that were made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O’Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Sachse’s application to be complete at the February 6, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to deny Mr. Sachse’s application for *demolition* in the Yorktown Historic District and under the City of Tulsa Ordinance, Chapter 10A. Vice-Chairperson O’Neal stated that the Subcommittee recommended to deny this application based on Section F.1.O.1, General Requirements from the Yorktown Guidelines; and from Chapter 10A, Historic Preservation, Section 1055D, *Applications Involving Demolition – Stay* from the City of Tulsa Ordinance.

Chairman Turner asked if anyone had any comments or opinions to make on the Sachse’s demolition proposal.

An interested party stated that she believes that they're sending the wrong message by allowing demolition to continue due to lack of knowledge and for lack of funds. She stated that "we have to stop demolishing houses."

Yorktown resident, Mark Radzinski stated that he would never support an ordinance taking your rights away to tear down your own house. He stated that he doesn't want anyone else, but himself, to tell him that he can tear down his own house. Mr. Radzinski stated that the difference would be that he would never tear his house down.

Susan McKee stated that a house in Yorktown was proposed to be demolished and ended up not getting demolished; and now the house is worth over \$300,000.00. Ms. McKee believes that the Commission should deny this demolition request.

V-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendations to deny Mr. Sachse's application. Commissioner Ball seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion. After a brief discussion took place, Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Deny Mr. Sachse's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Secretary Smallwood – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Abstain;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Dusty Peck – Aye; &

Alice Rodgers - Aye.

The motion was **Approved by Majority to Deny by members present and voting.**

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Brian Sachse's proposal based on General Requirements, Section F.1.0.1, from Guidelines for Demolition of Residential Structures for the Yorktown Historic District; and from Chapter 10A, Historic Preservation, Section 1055D, Applications Involving Demolition – Stay of the City of Tulsa Ordinance.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Sharrer to please give his presentation on the next COA agenda item.

6. **1320 E. 19th St.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Candace Melton

Request: Construct new front walkway and landing from sidewalk to front door of residence. Walk materials will be Pennsylvania blue stone with brick edge ribbon. At the sidewalk, construct two 24" tall brick columns flanking the new walkway. Columns will be capped with light fixtures. All brick materials will match house.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 02-06-2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Candace Melton's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in Swan Lake.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Ms. Melton plans to construct a new front walkway and landing from the sidewalk to the front door of her residence. He stated that the walk materials will be Pennsylvania blue stone with brick edge ribbon; and at the sidewalk, Ms. Melton plans to construct two (2) 24" tall brick columns flanking the new walkway. Mr. Sharrer stated that the columns will be capped with light fixtures; and all the brick materials will match the structure.

Mr. Sharrer read aloud the appropriate guidelines for *New Construction* for the Swan Lake district.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairperson O'Neal to please give her report on the recommendations that were made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Ms. Melton's application to be complete at the February 6, 2007 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to approve Ms. Melton's application for *new construction* in the Swan Lake Historic District with the following conditions:

- ◇ That the applicant submit to the TPC on 02-08-2007 samples of materials on the Pennsylvania blue stone, the light fixture; and the brick edge ribbon (if the brick is unavailable it must be duplicated in texture and pattern as the existing brick on structure).

V-Chairperson O'Neal stated that Ms. Melton had provided the Commission with all the detailed information/materials that were recommended by the COA Subcommittee; and that she would like to make a motion to approve Melton's application with no conditions. Commissioner Bergman seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion. After a brief discussion took place, Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Ms. Melton's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Candace Melton's proposal based on Building Site, C1.1.4 & C1.1.5 and Building Materials, C1.2.1 for New Construction for the Swan Lake Historic District.

- C. **Rules & Regulations**
None.
 - D. **Program Planning & Neighborhood Conservation**
None.
- 4. Chair Report**

A. Communication within the TPC

Ms. DeCort announced that she would like to ask the Commission to please send any correspondence or agenda items by contacting her first. She stated that she will review the correspondence and give it to the appropriate party.

5. Staff Report

A. Preservation Plan update

Ms. DeCort stated that she is still in the process of creating a request for proposals for the Preservation Plan. Ms. DeCort stated that she will keep the Commission informed of its progress.

B. TPC Annual Retreat

After discussing a date for the Commission's 2007 Annual Retreat, the Commission has tentatively scheduled to have the retreat on Saturday, March 3, 2007 at the Greenwood Cultural Center on South Greenwood Avenue.

C. Website

Mr. Sharrer announced that the Tulsa Preservation Commission's Website is up. He stated that the website has three (3) website styles that will allow the visitor to customize the site; and that it has guidelines and HP maps that you can view and download.

6. Absence Report

None.

7. New Business

Under the Open Meeting Act, this agenda item is authorized only for matters not known about or which could not have been reasonably foreseen prior to the time of posting the agenda or any revised agenda.

None.

8. Communications

Commissioner Ball announced that the New York Times ran an article on Kendall-Whittier; and that the article was very interesting.

9. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairman Turner adjourned the meeting at 2:08 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of February 8, 2007 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

*K:/Planning/Fannie Warrior/MINS 02 08 2007R TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on*