



of the

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE
**TULSA PRESERVATION
COMMISSION**

Thursday, October 12, 2006, 11:00 A.M.
111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820

1. **Roll Call** - Chairman Turner called the regular meeting to order at 11:09 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

Members Present:

Chairman, James Turner; Vice-Chairman, David Breed; Rex Ball; Charles Gilmore; Jack Hodgson; Dusty Peck; Mary Lee Townsend; Bill Andoe; Breniss O'Neal; Bob Winchester; & Karen Rogers;

Member(s) Absent:

Herb Fritz; Barbara Imel Smallwood; & Chip Ard;

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort, Fannie Warrior, Kurt Ackermann, Gary Ziegler, Travis Fite, Susan O'Neal & Brian Hunt.

2. **Approval of Meeting Minutes: Regular Meeting Minutes from September 14, 2006**

Chairman Turner asked if there was a motion on the floor to approve the meeting minutes from last month.

Mr. Gilmore made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes from September 14, 2006, as presented. Mr. Hodgson seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Meeting Minutes from September 14, 2006:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Jack Hodgson – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Was not present during this vote;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Dusty Peck – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Abstain; &

Karen Rogers - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

3. Unfinished Business

A. Historic Preservation Committee Report

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

Chairman Turner asked the commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with any of the Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Requests that would be brought before the board for review. Members were instructed that the commissioner's name(s) would not be called when voting on the particular Certificate or Certificates of Appropriateness that he/she had a conflict of interest with. No one responded to having a conflict.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Chairman Turner briefly informed the COA applicants of the COA processing procedures of how their proposals would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination.

Chairman Turner introduced and welcomed Ms. Karen Rogers to the Commission. Ms. Rogers was appointed by the Mayor to serve on the Commission as a representative for Tulsa Public Schools. The Commission welcomed Ms. Rogers aboard.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. DeCort to please give her presentation on COA agenda item #1, Gary & Lisa Ziegler at 901 N. Denver Avenue.

- 1. 901 N. Denver Ave., Tulsa, OK 74106 (Brady Heights)
Applicants: Gary & Lisa Ziegler**

Request: Propose to replace rural type mailbox; add central HVAC unit with associated conduit & plumbing on North side of structure; & add a “Historic Structure Plaque” by front door.

COA Complete Application Date: Oct. 10, 2006

Ms. DeCort presented Gary & Lisa Ziegler’s Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in Brady Heights.

Ms. DeCort stated that the Zieglers plan to replace their rural type mailbox with a horizontal mailbox installed on the front of the structure; add a central HVAC unit with an associated conduit and plumbing on the North side of structure; and add a “Historic Structure Plaque” by their front door.

Ms. DeCort read aloud the appropriate guidelines for “Restoring existing structures” in the Brady Heights district.

Ms. DeCort stated that the replacement mailbox that the Zieglers are planning to install is a horizontal mailbox by Solar Group Townhouse Collection. It is a heavy-duty galvanized steel mailbox with a baked enamel finish that has steel magazine hooks; and that the size of the mailbox is 6-3/8”H x 15-1/2”W x 3-1/8”D.

Mr. Ziegler didn’t make any comments or add any information to Ms. DeCort’s presentation.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please report to the Commission the recommendations that were made on this proposal at the last COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee considered the Ziegler’s application to be complete at the October 10, 2006 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended at a unanimously vote to approve the Ziegler’s application with the following conditions that were based on the appropriate design guidelines for restoring in the Brady Heights Historic District.

- ◇ That staff recommends to the Zieglers for placement of the plaque.

Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee’s recommendations to approve the Ziegler’s application with conditions, as indicated above. Secretary O’Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion. No further information was brought forth. Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Gary & Lisa Ziegler's application w/conditions at 901 N. Denver Avenue:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O'Neal – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Jack Hodgson – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye; &
Karen Rogers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Gary & Lisa Ziegler's proposal based on Mailboxes, Paragraph 1; & Engineering Systems-Mechanical, Electrical and Plumbing, Paragraph 1 for the Brady Heights Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. DeCort to please give her presentation on COA agenda item #2, Gary & Lisa Ziegler at 215-217 W. Jasper Street in Brady Heights.

- 2. 215-217 W. Jasper Street, Tulsa, OK 74106 (Brady Heights)
Applicants: Gary & Lisa Ziegler
Request: Propose to replace one (1) mailbox and add another mailbox by two apartment entry doors - vertical style mailbox; add two (2) central HVAC units with associated conduit & plumbing on North side of structure; & remove two (2) junction boxes & conduits on East side of structure; & add storm windows on the carriage house that are missing.
COA Complete Application Date: Oct. 10, 2006**

Ms. DeCort presented Gary & Lisa Ziegler's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in Brady Heights.

Ms. DeCort stated that the Zieglers plan to replace one (1) mailbox and add another mailbox by two of the apartment entry doors - vertical style mailbox; add two (2) central HVAC units with an associated conduit and plumbing on the North side of the structure. She stated that the Zieglers would also like to remove two (2) junction boxes and conduits on the East side of the structure; and add storm windows on the carriage house that are missing.

Ms. DeCort read aloud the appropriate guidelines for “Restoring Existing Structures” in the Brady Heights district.

Ms. DeCort stated that Mr. Ziegler has indicated that he will replace the damaged storm windows; and add storm windows where they are missing. She stated that the storm windows will be glass on top with screen on the bottom. A divider will line up with the windows’ meeting rail so they do not obscure the view of the windows.

Mr. Ziegler added that the storm windows and window panes will be painted.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please report to the Commission the recommendations that were made on this proposal at the last COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee considered the Ziegler’s application to be complete at the October 10, 2006 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended at unanimously vote to approve the Ziegler’s application with the following conditions that were based on the appropriate design guidelines for restoring in the Brady Heights Historic District.

- ◇ That the storm windows do not obscure the 6 over 6 windows on the carriage house.

Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee’s recommendations to approve the Ziegler’s application with conditions, as indicated above. Secretary O’Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion. No further information was brought forth. Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Gary & Lisa Ziegler’s application w/conditions at 215-217 W. Jasper Street:

- Chairman Turner – Aye;
- Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
- Secretary O’Neal – Aye;
- Charles Gilmore – Aye;
- Jack Hodgson – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye; &
Karen Rogers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously by members present and voting.**

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Gary & Lisa Ziegler's proposal based on Mailboxes, Paragraph 1; & Engineering Systems-Mechanical, Electrical and Plumbing, Paragraph 1; and Accessories, Paragraph 1 for the Brady Heights Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. DeCort to please give her presentation on COA agenda item #3, Travis Fite at 714 N. Denver Avenue in Brady Heights.

- 3. 714 N. Denver, Tulsa, OK 74106 (Brady Heights)
Applicant: Travis Fite
Request: Propose to replace thirteen (13) existing wood windows, due to lack of maintenance, with Simonton platinum series vinyl high efficiency windows.
COA Complete Application Date: Oct. 10, 2006**

Ms. DeCort presented Travis Fite's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the Bungalow historic home in Brady Heights.

Ms. DeCort stated that Mr. Fite plans to replace thirteen (13) existing wood windows, due to lack of maintenance, with thirteen (13) Simonton platinum series vinyl high efficiency windows.

Ms. DeCort read aloud the appropriate guidelines for Windows and Doors for "Restoring existing structures" in the Brady Heights district. She indicated that the guidelines state under Preferred Option – Repair and restore original windows and doors to preserve the historic appearance. Retain the original or existing windows and doors, their glazing, trim, and the character-defining elements through repair. Retain existing window and door locations – not removing, covering or enclosing them. Ms. DeCort further read the guidelines under Windows & Doors stating that "if the existing materials and details have deteriorated beyond reasonable repair,

replacements should be similar in sash design and appearance, maintaining the material original to the structure, size, shape, muntin pattern, glazing area and tint, and placement locations. Replacement windows having thermal and maintenance-reducing qualities may be used, but must maintain the appearance, character, and defining elements of the original window pattern.

Ms. DeCort added that the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, on which the guidelines are based, require that you must first repair existing material whenever possible; if that is not an option, you must replace existing material with the same material; finally, if none of the previous options are possible, you may replace with a different material. She added that Brady Heights' guidelines are worded in such a way that vinyl windows could only replace existing vinyl windows.

Ms. DeCort stated that it is staff's opinion that all the windows at 714 N. Denver Avenue are salvageable; and that the white vinyl high efficiency windows are inappropriate under the neighborhood's guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fite if he had anything to add to Ms. DeCort's presentation. Mr. Fite stated that most of all of the windows on the bottom part of the upper sash are rotten on every one of the windows. He stated that the windows are either rotten or dried to the point where you can squeeze it and it turns into powder. Mr. Fite stated that there's quite a bit of air stream coming through the windows sills. He stated that there are several panes of glass that are broken out of the window panes; and that he was scheduled to be moved into the house by the end of the month.

Mr. Fite stated that he was not aware that he was supposed to go before the board on a matter such as this. He asked the Commission if his proposal wasn't approved today, if he could have request approval for full-view storm windows to be installed on the structure.

Mr. Gilmore addressed the Commission by stating that he believes that the Commission doesn't have enough information to make a decision on Mr. Fite's new proposal to have storm windows installed on the structure, due to not having the product information before them to make a determination.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please report to the Commission the recommendations that were made on this proposal at the last COA Subcommittee meeting.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Fite's application to be complete at the October 10, 2006 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended at

unanimously vote to deny Mr. Fite's application based on the appropriate design guidelines for restoring in the Brady Heights Historic District; and that he so moved. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner stated that Brady Heights Representative, Tim Williams stated at the October 10, 2006 COA Subcommittee meeting that he believed that the windows on this structure are repairable.

Chairman Turner told Mr. Fite that if he wants to install full view storm windows on the structure that he would have to make another application. Mr. Fite brought to the Chairman's attention that he was scheduled to be in the house by the end of October; and that he would like to have the storm windows installed soon because the house was drafty and cold.

Legal Advisor, Kurt Ackermann stated that the Commission could have a Special Meeting within fourteen (14) days of this meeting if it so chose. Chairman Turner scheduled to have a Special TPC Meeting on Tuesday, October 24, 2006 at 11:00 a.m. Mr. Fite stated that he will submit another application.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion. No further information was brought forth. Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Deny Mr. Fite's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye to Deny;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye to Deny;
Secretary O'Neal – Aye to Deny;
Charles Gilmore – Aye to Deny;
Jack Hodgson – Aye to Deny;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye to Deny;
Rex Ball – Aye to Deny;
Bill Andoe – Aye to Deny;
Dusty Peck – Aye to Deny;
Bob Winchester – Aye to Deny; &
Karen Rogers – Aye to Deny.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously to Deny** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Travis Fite's proposal based on Windows & Doors, Preferred Option, Paragraphs 1 & 2; & Second Preference, Paragraphs 1 through 4 for the Brady Heights Historic District.

B. Rules & Regulations
None.

C. Program Planning & Neighborhood Conservation
None.

Chairman Turner moved to Agenda Item 5., Staff Report.

5. Staff Report

Ms. DeCort briefly went over the staff approval requests that had been recently granted for some neighborhood residents. These staff approvals were in Brady Heights, Swan Lake and North Maple Ridge.

Chairman Turner moved to Agenda Item 4., Chair Report.

4. Chair Report

A. Core Recommendations

Chairman Turner stated that Brian Hunt from the National Association of Industrial & Office Properties (NAIOP) and President of the Tulsa Chapter was here at this meeting to hear about the results from the September 28th CORE Recommendations Meeting.

Chairman Turner stated that he met with Amanda DeCort, Rex Ball, Pat Treadway, Susan Neal, and Don Himelfarb, the new Economic Development Director for the City of Tulsa, on the 28th of September regarding the CORE Report. Chairman Turner stated that he believes that it was a very good meeting; and that the ending results of the meeting was basically a four (4) step approach of actions that Don Himelfarb wants to take:

- First Recommendation: - Have an architectural survey of the IDL (Inner Dispersal Loop) and possibly some areas adjacent to the IDL; (by trying to locate funds to get a survey based on the National Park Service Guidelines for Downtown Tulsa);
- Second Recommendation: – To convene a group of people including planning staff; preservation staff; and various organized entities to identify things that impede downtown development and rehabilitation of downtown buildings. Chair Turner stated that basically, included in that would be discussion about what disincentives there are, such as the difficulty in meeting code and the belief among developers that the Fire Marshall's stance on fire suppression has a negative impact on the financial reality of rehabilitating downtown buildings. He stated that the group would discuss the issues and ways to address them.

- Third Recommendation: To convene a meeting to discuss incentives that are available or could be developed. He stated this will be a meeting that the TPC leadership and Pat Treadway will be involved in; and that Don Himelfarb will facilitate the discussion. He stated that it's basically a coalition of people to discuss incentives for downtown development and rehabilitation and adaptive reuse.
- Fourth Recommendation: Once the first three items are in place, then the group will revisit the CORE Recommendations to review them in light of this process, and address the issues at hand.

Chairman Turner stated that Mr. Himelfarb had mentioned after the meeting that they were going to look for outside funds for the downtown intensive-level survey. Chairman Turner also mentioned that Ms. DeCort was in the process of trying to get funds from the Certified Local Governments Program (CLG) Grant for part of the survey because the grant isn't enough money to cover the entire cost of the survey.

Mr. Hunt addressed the Commission by asking: What is actually in the survey? He asked if the survey was going to be conducted inside the Inner Dispersal Loop or outside the Inner Dispersal Loop? He stated that for what it's worth, that he would advocate if they would really look into the issue because there are some great areas North and South of the inner-dispersal loop that he would like to see surveyed.

Chairman Turner thanked Mr. Hunt for sharing his comments and ideas with the Commission.

6. Absence Request

None.

7. New Business

Any matter not known about or which could not have been reasonably foreseen prior to the time of posting.

None.

8. Communications

Mr. Ball stated that he had given Ms. Rogers, our new Tulsa Public Schools Representative a copy of an application for National Register for Will Rogers High School. Mr. Ball would like to have Ms. Rogers

assist in the process of submitting the application; and Ms. Rogers agreed to do so.

Mr. Ball announced that the National Trust Conference is going to be held in Pittsburgh, PA this year that begins on October 31st and will run through the 5th of November. Ms. DeCort stated that she will be attending the National Trust Conference in Pittsburgh this year.

9. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairman Turner adjourned the meeting at 12:48 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of October 12, 2006 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

*K:/Planning/Fannie Warrior/MINS 10 12 2006R TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on 11-16-2006*