



REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION (TPC)

Thursday, January 12, 2006, 11:00 A.M.
111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Room E
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820

Chairman Turner called the regular meeting to order at 11:19 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

I. ROLL CALL

Members Present:

Chairman, James Turner, Comm. Group Res.,
Vice-Chairman, David Breed, Comm. Group Res.,
Sec. & Prof., Landscape Designer, Breniss O'Neal;
Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian;
Rex Ball, Community Group Resident;
Barbara Imel Smallwood, Community Group Resident;
Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;
Owen "Chip" Ard – Planning Commissioner;
John Hamill, Professional TPS Representative; &
Chuck Chastain, Professional Banker.

Members Absent:

Michael B. Birkes, Arts Commissioner;
Herb Fritz, Professional Architect;
Jack Hodgson, Professional Realtor;

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort, Patrick Fox, Fannie Warrior, Kurt Ackermann, Doug Campbell, Daniel J. Flannery & David Williams.

II. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES, Regular Meeting Minutes of December 8, 2005

Chairman Turner asked if there was a motion on the floor to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes of December 8, 2005.

Ms. Townsend made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes of December 8, 2005, as presented. Mr. Chastain seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Regular Meeting Minutes of December 8, 2005:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;
Chuck Chastain – Aye;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend - Aye;
Rex Ball – Was not present during this vote;
Barbara Smallwood – Aye;
John Hamill - Aye; &
Chip Ard – Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

III. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

A. Announcements of any Conflict of Interest:

Chairman Turner asked the commission if anyone had a Conflict of Interest with any of the Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Requests that would be brought before the board for review. Members were instructed that the commissioner's name(s) would not be called when voting on the particular Certificate or Certificates of Appropriateness that he/she had a conflict of interest with. After no one responded, Chairman Turner moved to the next agenda item.

B. Caveats and Education – Doug Campbell

Mr. Campbell stated that he had purchased a challenging piece of property with a park in the back and a view of downtown Tulsa to build his one-story dream home. He stated that he was told by a staff member of the commission that this particular piece of property was not in a historic preservation (HP) zoned area; but that after purchasing the property that he found out that the property was in the North Maple Ridge HP zoned district. Mr. Campbell stated that he would not want anyone to go through what he has endured with this property. Mr. Campbell had previously announced at one of the TPC meetings last year that he had decided to sell this property due to the negative experience that he had gone through. Mr. Campbell stated that he is strongly in favor of preservation. However, Mr. Campbell stated that the HP boundaries for the North Maple Ridge district have not yet been corrected (as of the end of December 2005) on the Tulsa Preservation Commission's website. Mr. Fox respectfully intervened by stating that the boundaries for the North Maple Ridge district have been corrected.

Mr. Campbell stated that he believes that the position that the commission put him in was not fair because of the necessary research work that wasn't done. He asked the commission to please work with the neighborhood associations and real estate agents in the HP districts to make sure that they're all referred to Indian Nations Council of Governments (INCOG) for all HP zoning maps and other correspondence. Mr. Campbell asked the commission members if they would help him sell his property; and added that - building this house in the HP district has been an expensive experience for him. He thanked the commission for its time.

Ms. DeCort stated that she will make sure that the HP zoning district maps will be

filed in the Tulsa County City Clerk's Office in a timely manner.

C. Certificates of Appropriateness Request:

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #1, on Daniel J. Flannery's proposal at 1303 E. 17th Place.

- 1) **1303 E. 17th Place, Tulsa, OK 74120 (Swan Lake)**
Request: Propose to replace all windows with energy-efficient replacement windows
COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: Jan. 10, 2006
DANIEL J. FLANNERY

Mr. Fox presented Mr. Flannery's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in Swan Lake.

Mr. Fox stated that Mr. Flannery plans to replace all the wood windows of the structure with energy-efficient replacement windows. He stated that the house has had some fire damage to it; and that the fire occurred about two years ago. He stated that most of the damage is on the east side of the structure; but that Mr. Flannery plans to replace all the wood windows. He stated that the house was abandoned after the fire; and that it had been vacant since the new owner Mr. Flannery recently purchased it.

Mr. Fox stated that the COA Subcommittee suggested that Mr. Flannery remove all the awnings from the structure; and that Mr. Flannery had agreed to have them removed. Mr. Fox stated that once the awnings are removed that the unique diamond shaped patterned 5/1 double hung windows will be exposed. He stated that Mr. Flannery has provided the commission to review a brochure of the double hung windows with exterior mullions; although the windows that Mr. Flannery plans to install are 1/1 without the mullions.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Flannery if he had anything to add to Mr. Fox's presentation. Mr. Flannery stated that he has provided the commission with an example of the 1/1 window that he would like to install on the structure; and that the windows will not have mullions.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed if he would announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation on this proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed announced that the COA Subcommittee found Mr. Flannery's application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended by a majority vote at the January 10, 2006 meeting approving Mr. Flannery's application with the following conditions:

- ◇ That Mr. Flannery has the awnings removed; replace all the 5/1 wood windows and make sure that the sash proportion be as close to the original as possible.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Rehabilitation in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve Mr. Flannery's application with the conditions indicated above and Ms. Townsend seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor for discussion. Several commissioners commented that the 5-over-1 diamond-pattern windows were a character-defining feature of the house, and would be visible were it not for the awnings. Since the awnings are to be removed, the diamond-pattern windows would be visible. Chairman Turner stated that the pattern could be replicated on the replacement windows.

Vice-Chairman Breed made an amended motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve Mr. Flannery's application with new conditions and Ms. Townsend amended to seconding the motion.

- ◇ That Mr. Flannery replicate the design pattern of the mullions on the upper sash; and apply a grille or divider

Chairman Turner asked the commission if there were further discussion on this application. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Mr. Flannery's application with conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Chuck Chastain – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend - Aye;

Rex Ball – - Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye;

John Hamill - Aye; &

Chip Ard – Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Mr. Flannery's proposal based on Windows and Doors, A.1.2.2, A.1.2.3, A.1.2.4 & A.1.2.6 for Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #2, on David Williams' proposal at 823 N. Cheyenne Avenue.

- 2) **823 N. Cheyenne Ave., Tulsa, OK 74106 (Brady Heights)**

Propose to repair and replace original eave details, siding materials, and decorative details with like materials and characteristics.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: Jan. 10, 2006

DAVID WILLIAMS

Mr. Fox presented Mr. Williams' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in Brady Heights.

Mr. Fox stated that Mr. Williams plans to replace the original eave details, the siding materials, the decorative band and crown piece with like materials to maintain the characteristics of the structure. Mr. Fox stated that the only change that the applicant plans to make is the exposure of the rafter tails.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Williams if he had anything to add to Mr. Fox's presentation. Mr. Williams stated that he did not have anything to add.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed if he would announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation on this proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed announced that the COA Subcommittee found Mr. Williams' application to be complete. He stated that Brady Heights Representative, Tim Williams voted against this proposal. He stated that Brady Heights Representative, Mr. Williams had questions on the design of redesigning the vent; and that he had informed the subcommittee that he would meet with the owner and neighborhood residents to try to come up with a design of duplicating the vent to other neighborhood vents. Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the subcommittee recommended by a majority vote at the January 10, 2006 meeting approving Mr. Williams' application with the following conditions:

- ◇ To recommend approval of open eaves; that the front eave projection be restored; and replacement of all exterior materials would be to match the existing based on the old photographs.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines to restore in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve Mr. Williams' application with the conditions indicated above and Mr. Ball seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor for discussion.

Mr. Gilmore believes that the exposed soffits, decking and bead board should be similar in design and appearance; and that it should be added to the motion.

Vice-Chairman Breed accepted to amend the motion to Mr. Gilmore's request; and Mr. Ball also accepted to amend seconding it to the motion.

The amended motion should read:

- ◇ To recommend approval of open eaves; that the front eave projection be restored; and replacement of all exterior materials would be to match the existing based on the old photographs. That the exposed soffits, decking and bead board should be similar in design and appearance.

Chairman Turner asked the commission if there were further discussion on this application. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Mr. Williams' application with conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Chuck Chastain – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend - Aye;

Rex Ball – - Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye;

John Hamill - Aye; &

Chip Ard – Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission “Approved Mr. Williams' proposal” based on Guidelines for Building Wall Materials, Preferred Option – Retain and maintain the original wall materials, Paragraphs #1 & #2; and Second Preference – Replace wall materials that retain the original historic appearance, Paragraphs #1 through #3 for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #3, on Michael E. Schmitz's proposal at 1601 S. Detroit.

- 3) **1601 S. Detroit, Tulsa, OK 74120 (North Maple Ridge)**
Request: Propose to replace iron porch railing with wood railing to match original.
COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: Jan. 10, 2006
MICHAEL E. SCHMITZ

Mr. Fox presented Mr. Schmitz' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in North Maple Ridge.

Mr. Fox stated that Mr. Schmitz was unable to attend the meeting; although he plans to replace the iron porch railing with a wood railing to match the original.

Mr. Fox stated that Mr. Schmitz has submitted to the commission a March 11, 1940 Property Survey Certificate of this structure at 1601 S. Detroit showing a photograph of the original 1940 wood railing that Mr. Schmitz plans to install.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed if he would announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation on this proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed announced that the COA Subcommittee found Mr. Schmitz' application to be complete. Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Rehabilitation in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve Mr. Schmitz' application and Ms. O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor for discussion. One member stated that this proposal was a "slam dunk."

Chairman Turner asked the commission if there were further discussion on this application. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Mr. Schmitz' application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Chuck Chastain – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Abstain;

Rex Ball – - Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye;

John Hamill - Aye; &

Chip Ard – Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

D. Elect New Officers for 2006

◇ **Vice Chairperson; &**

◇ **Secretary**

Chairman Turner announced that the Vice Chairperson (David Breed) and Secretary (Breniss O'Neal) of the Tulsa Preservation Commission were voted on at last month's meeting to nominate and elect the two (2) new 2006 officers by acclamation. No vote was taken.

E. Excused Absence Request:

◇ **Herb Fritz – Job Conflict; &**

◇ **Michael Birkes – Job Conflict**

Chairman Turner stated that the requests from Mr. Fritz and Mr. Birkes requesting that they be excused from the January 12, 2006 Regular Meeting are considered to be “moot.” Chairman Turner stated that their absences are considered to be moot at this time due to this meeting being the first meeting of the year.

He stated that according to the guidelines that such formal excusal for absences may only be approved for those absences in excess of four (4) during a particular calendar year; and that Mr. Fritz nor Mr. Birkes has missed four (4) regular/special meetings during this calendar year of 2006.

IV. STAFF REPORTS

A. TPC staff report – Amanda DeCort and Patrick Fox

Ms. DeCort stated that she would like to remind everyone and to encourage them to please attend the 2006 TPC Annual Retreat on Saturday, January 21st at the Greenwood Cultural Center. She stated that a time had not yet been confirmed; but that she will inform everyone when she does.

Mr. Fox reported that he will make sure that the Tulsa Preservation Commission Website be more user-friendly relating to all historic preservation (hp) information.

Mr. Fox reported that Jim Gabbert, Architectural Historian from the Oklahoma Historical Society in Oklahoma City will be here in Tulsa next week. He stated that Mr. Gabbert will be reviewing the proposed Riverview Historic District boundaries again.

V. CHAIR REPORT – James Turner

Chairman Turner stated that he met with Chip Atkins of the Swan Lake Neighborhood Association and several neighborhood residents about changing our Rules & Regulations. He stated that he would like to place on the next TPC Regular Meeting Agenda a reappointment procedure for Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Annual Attendance to the TPC/COA Subcommittee.

A. Committee Reports:

◇ Historic Preservation Committee

Chair: David Breed

COA Sub-Committee:

Chairman Breed reported and announced the COA Subcommittee’s recommendations from the January 10, 2006 meeting.

Important/Endangered Resources Sub-Committee:

David Breed, Chairman

Rex Ball

Chairman Breed stated that if anyone has any buildings that they would like to add to the Important/Endangered Resources List to please send or give them to him

Historic Preservation Zoning & Conservation

District Sub-Committee: Charles Gilmore,
Chairperson

No Report.

Historic Preservation Incentive Subcommittee:

No Report.

◇ **Rules & Regulations Committee**

Charles Gilmore, Chairperson

Rules & Regulations Sub-Committee:

Charles Gilmore, Chairperson

Chairman Gilmore reported that the final draft of the Rules & Regulations Governing Procedure of the Tulsa Preservation Commission will be reviewed by the subcommittee on January 18, 2006.

Awards & Recognition Sub-Committee:

Rex Ball, Chairperson

Chairman Ball reported that the last award was given out to Burrell Ford a few years ago; and if anyone was aware of anyone else who deserved to receive an award to contact him.

Community Outreach Sub-Committee:

Rex Ball, Chairperson

Chairman Ball stated that he believes that the TPC needs its own library for maps, exhibits, etc. Ms. DeCort responded by stating that she has gotten permission from management to create a TPC Library for historic preservation resources and that she's going to start working on it shortly.

Chairman Ball stated that TPC staff is sending a letter to Bob LaBass, Executive Director of Bond Projects of Tulsa Public Schools (TPS) to offer TPC's support and assistance regarding improvements to TPS historic school buildings that will involve casement windows.

◇ **Program Planning & Neighborhood Conservation Committee**

Chair: Rex Ball

HP Education Sub-Committee:

Chairman Ball stated that he would like to coordinate a joint meeting with the Board of Adjustment and Tulsa Preservation Commission in the near future. Mr. Ackermann responded by stating that he will get with the Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission (TMAPC) Secretary about scheduling a meeting in the near future.

National Register Sub-Committee:

Michael Birkes, Chairperson

No report.

Neighborhood History Sub-Committee:

Herb Fritz, Chairperson

No Report.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

Chairman Turner reminded the commissioners of the 2006 TPC Annual Retreat; and that he asked them to please try to make every effort to attend this meeting on Saturday, January 21st at the Greenwood Cultural Center.

VII. COMMUNICATIONS

None.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

There being no other business, Chairman Turner adjourned the meeting at 1:20 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of January 12, 2006 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

*K:/Planning/Fannie Warrior/MINS 01 12 2006R TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on 02 09-2006*