



**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
OF THE
TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

**Thursday, September 10, 2009, 11:00 a.m.
175 E. 2nd Street, 10th Floor North Conference Room
Tulsa, OK 74103**

- 1. Roll Call** – Vice-Chair Sober called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:08 a.m.

Members Present:

Vice-Chairman Bob Sober, Arts Commissioner;
Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;
Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian;
Kristen Bergman, Building Owner, Non-Residential;
Anne Pollard, Community Group Resident;
Pamela Curtis, Community Group Resident;
Elizabeth A. Wright, Planning Commissioner;
Jack Hodgson, Professional Real Estate Broker;
Jim Turner, Community Group Resident;
Secretary, Paula Wood, Professional Tulsa Public Schools Rep.;
Bob Winchester, Professional Banker;
Breniss O'Neal; Community Group Resident; &
Matt King, Professional Architect;

Members Absent:

Chair, Barbara Smallwood;
Robert Shears, Professional Landscape Architect; &

Others Present:

Patrick Boulden, Fannie Warrior, Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer, Susan McKee, Guy & Stephanie deVerges, Martin Newman and Bob LaBass.

2. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting of Regular Meeting Minutes for August 13, 2009;

Vice-Chair Sober asked if anyone would like to make a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for August 13, 2009.

Commissioner Wright made a motion to *Approve* the Regular Meeting Minutes for August 13, 2009 as presented. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Vice-Chair Sober asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve the August 13, 2009 Regular Meeting Minutes:

- (1) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (2) Secretary Wood;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Jack Hodgson;
- (6) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (7) Jim Turner;
- (8) Kristen Bergman;
- (9) Elizabeth Wright;
- (10) Bob Winchester;
- (11) Matt King; &
- (12) Pamela Curtis;

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

- (13) Anne Pollard;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

3. A. Historic Preservation Committee

**1. Announcement of Conflict of Interest
*Action Needed***

Vice-Chair Sober asked the Commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) requests that have been brought before the Commission today. No one responded to having a conflict of interest with any of the proposals.

**ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness
*Vote Needed***

Vice-Chair Sober moved to Agenda Item 3. A. ii., COA Applicant #3 for Guy & Stephanie deVerges at 1635 E. 17th Place because neither COA Applicants #1 or #2 were present at the meeting.

3. 1635 E. 17th Place (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Guy & Stephanie de Verges

Request:

I. Replace existing composite asphalt shingled roof with standing seam metal roof;

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:
09-08-2009

***PROPOSAL DENIED
(PART I OF III PARTS)***

Mr. Sharrer presented Part I of III Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that the deVerges' plan to replace the existing composite asphalt shingled roof with a standing seam metal roof.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Part I of the deVerges' proposal under *Rehabilitation* for this district.

Guy & Stephanie deVerges were present at the meeting. Ms. deVerges addressed the Board stating that she would like to replace the roof with the standing seam metal roofing because it's more historical.

A number of board members did not believe that the standing seam metal roof was appropriate for the deVerges' home because such roofs were not historically common in Tulsa. Based on the Swan Lake guidelines, the standing seam metal roof did not meet the guidelines of having its original shape, pattern, texture and directional orientation of the existing roof to allow for replacement.

Vice-Chair Sober gave the report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Part I of the deVerges' application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part I of the deVerges' application to be complete at the September 8, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve Part I of the deVerges' proposal* based on the appropriate design guidelines. Commissioner Wright stated that she would like to make a motion to approve Part I of the deVerges' application with no conditions. The motion was seconded by Commissioner King.

The motion to *Approve Part I* of this application, *Failed*.

Another motion was made by Commissioner Wright to *Deny Part I* of this application. The motion was 2nd by Commissioner King.

After a hand count, the motion passed by a majority vote to *Deny Part I* of the deVerges' application by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Part I of III Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' proposal based on guidelines under Section VIIIA, Roofs, A.1.3.1, A.1.3.2 & A.1.3.3; for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake District.

3. 1635 E. 17th Place (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Guy & Stephanie de Verges

Request:

- II.** Remove existing wood window on second story of west elevation, enlarge opening, install 15-light French door;

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

09-08-2009

***APPROVED with No Conditions
(PART II OF III PARTS)***

Mr. Sharrer presented Part II of III Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that the deVerges' plan to remove the existing wood window on the second story of the west elevation, enlarge the opening; and install a 15-light French door.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Part II of the deVerges' proposal under *Rehabilitation* for this district.

Vice-Chair Sober gave the report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Part II of the deVerges' application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part II of the deVerges' application to be complete at the September 8, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve Part II of the deVerges' proposal* based on the appropriate design guidelines. Commissioner Wright stated that she would like to make a motion to approve Part II of the deVerges' application with no conditions.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner King for *Approval of Part II* of this application.

After further review of the application, Vice-Chair Sober asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Part II of III Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' application with no conditions:

- (1) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (2) Secretary Wood;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Jack Hodgson;

- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Anne Pollard;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Elizabeth Wright;
- (9) Bob Winchester;
- (10) Matt King; &
- (11) Pamela Curtis;

All Opposed:

- (12) Charles Gilmore; &
- (13) Jim Turner

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part II of III Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' proposal based on guidelines under Section VIIIA, General Requirements, A.1.0.1; Windows and Doors, A.1.2.2 & A.1.2.5 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake District.

3. 1635 E. 17th Place (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Guy & Stephanie deVerges

Request:

III. Install 42" tall metal railing around perimeter of roof deck on west elevation.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

09-08-2009

***APPROVED with Conditions
(PART III OF III PARTS)***

Mr. Sharrer presented Part III of III Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that the deVerges' plan to install a 42" tall metal railing around the perimeter of the roof deck on the west elevation of the structure.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Part III of the deVerges' proposal under *Rehabilitation* for this district.

Vice-Chair Sober gave the report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Part III of the deVerges' application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part III of the deVerges' application to be complete at the September 8, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve Part III of the deVerges'* proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines. Commissioner Wright stated that she would like to make a motion to approve Part III of the deVerges' application with the condition that:

- The railing will not exceed 42"

The motion was seconded by Commissioner King.

After a hand count, the motion passed by a majority vote to *Approve Part III* of the deVerges' application with a condition by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approve Part III of III Parts of Guy & Stephanie deVerges' proposal based on guidelines under Section VIIIA, General Requirements, A.1.0.1; & Porches, Decks and Patios, A.1.4.1 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake District.

- 4. 1719 E. 16th Street (Yorktown)
Applicant: Chris Bumgarner
Request: Demolition of house on lot.
COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:
09-08-2009
PROPOSAL DENIED**

Mr. Sharrer presented Chris Bumgarner's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final

review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Bumgarner plans to demolish the home at 1719 E. 16th Street because it was no longer a leasable property.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Yorktown Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Mr. Bumgarner's proposal under *Demolition* for this district.

Mr. Bumgarner was unable to attend the meeting.

Yorktown Neighborhood Association member, Susan McKee stated that she would not like to see the house demolished; and believes that the structure could be rehabilitated.

Yorktown neighborhood resident, Guy deVerges added that when a house is demolished that there's a much greater environmental impact than many people are aware of.

Vice-Chair Sober gave the report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Mr. Bumgarner's application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Bumgarner's application to be complete at the September 8, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Deny* Mr. Bumgarner's proposal based on the appropriate guidelines. Vice-Chair Sober made a motion to Deny Mr. Bumgarner's application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

After further review of the application, Vice-Chair Sober asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Deny Chris Bumgarner's application:

- (1) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (2) Secretary Wood;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Jack Hodgson;
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;

- (6) Jim Turner;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Elizabeth Wright;
- (9) Bob Winchester;
- (10) Matt King;
- (11) Pamela Curtis;
- (12) Charles Gilmore; &
- (13) Anne Pollard

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Denied Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Chris Bumgarner's proposal based on guidelines under Section IXF, General Requirements, F.1.0.1, F.1.0.2 & F.1.0.3 for Demolition of Residential Structures for the Yorktown District.

Vice-Chair Sober moved to Agenda Item 1. A. ii., COA Applicant #1 for Tameco Gaines at 905 N. Cheyenne Avenue in Brady Heights.

1. 905 N. Cheyenne Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Tameco Gaines

Request: Install 4' tall ornamental metal fence in front yard.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 09-08-2009

DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented Tameco Gaines' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Ms. Gaines plans to install a 4' tall ornamental metal fence in the front yard of the structure. She has a small child and would like to install the fence for safety issues.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Ms. Gaines' proposal under *New Construction* for this district.

Ms. Gaines was unable to attend the meeting.

The Commission believes that the 4' fence is too high in relationship to the house; and that the fence would be out of scale and proportion. It believes that a 3' fence is the standard height in the block of this neighborhood.

Vice-Chair Sober gave the report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Ms. Gaines' application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Ms. Gaines' application to be complete at the September 8, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Deny* Ms. Gaines' proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines. Vice-Chair Sober made a motion to Deny Ms. Gaines' application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner King.

After further review of the application, Vice-Chair Sober asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Deny Tameco Gaines' application:

- (1) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (2) Secretary Wood;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Jack Hodgson;
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Jim Turner;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Elizabeth Wright;
- (9) Bob Winchester;
- (10) Matt King;
- (11) Pamela Curtis;
- (12) Charles Gilmore; &
- (13) Anne Pollard

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was ***Denied Unanimously*** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Tameco Gaines' proposal based on guidelines under Building Site, Paragraph #6 for New Construction into the Brady Heights Historic District.

2. 625 N. Cheyenne Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Richard Hewitt

Request:

- I. Restore original panel detailing in gable end of west elevation based on shadow lines; &
- II. Replace missing gable end bracket on west elevation to match existing.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 09-08-2009

APPROVED (both Parts) with No Conditions

Mr. Sharrer presented Parts I & II of Richard Hewitt's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Hewitt plans to restore the original panel detailing in the gable end of the west elevation based on the shadow lines (Part I); & replace the missing gable end bracket on the west elevation to match the existing (Part II).

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for both parts of Mr. Hewitt's proposal under *Restore* for this district.

Vice-Chair Sober gave the report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on both parts of Mr. Hewitt's application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered both parts of Mr. Hewitt's application to be complete at the September 8, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority

vote to *Approve both parts of Mr. Hewett's* proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines. Vice-Chair Sober made a motion to approve both parts of Mr. Hewitt's application with no conditions.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal for *Approval of Both Parts* of this application.

After further review of the application, Vice-Chair Sober asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Both Parts of Richard Hewitt's application with no conditions:

- (1) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (2) Secretary Wood;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Jack Hodgson;
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Jim Turner;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Bob Winchester;
- (9) Matt King; &
- (10) Pamela Curtis;
- (11) Charles Gilmore; &
- (12) Anne Pollard

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

- (13) Elizabeth Wright;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Both Parts of Richard Hewitt's proposal based on guidelines under Building Wall Materials, Paragraph #1 for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

A. Rules & Regulations Committee

Rules & Regulations Committee Chairman Charles Gilmore reported that six pages of the Rules & Regulations Procedure had been distributed to the commissioners. He asked the Commission to please review the modifications of the Rules & Regulations that the committee has made; and that it will be placed on the agenda next month for voting. Chairman Gilmore stated that the committee will continue its work on the policy manual next week on Thursday, September 17th at 3:00 p.m.

B. Outreach Committee

Outreach Committee Chairperson Kristen Bergman reported that the Preservation Open House will be this Saturday, September 12, 2009 from 2:00 – 4:00 p.m., at St. Jerome's Church located at 205 West King Street. She encouraged everyone to come.

6. Chair Report

Vice-Chairman Sober did not have any information to report.

7. Staff Report

A. Letter of support from the Tulsa Preservation Commission for the I-244 Project Bundle (TIGER Grant)

Ms. DeCort asked the Commission to please consider officially supporting the TIGER Grant Application that Oklahoma Department of Transportation (ODOT) has prepared for construction of the multimodal bridge across the Arkansas River at I-244 here in Tulsa. The letter was verbally read to the Commission for review and for approval.

Commissioner Winchester made a motion to approve and support the I-244 Project Bundle (TIGER Grant Application). The motion was seconded by Commission King.

Vice-Chair Sober asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Support the I-244 Project Bundle (TIGER Grant Application):

(1) Vice-Chair Sober;

- (2) Secretary Wood;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Jack Hodgson;
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Jim Turner;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Bob Winchester;
- (9) Matt King; &
- (10) Pamela Curtis;
- (11) Charles Gilmore;
- (12) Anne Pollard; &
- (13) Elizabeth Wright;

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

6. Absence Report

No report.

7. New Business

Under the Open Meeting Act, this agenda item is authorized only for matters not known about or which could not have been reasonably foreseen prior to the time of posting the agenda or any revised agenda.

Mr. Sharrer stated that an article Announced in the September 6, 2009 edition of the Tulsa World about the Atlas Historic Building written by one of their editors was not true. Mr. Sharrer stated that he would like to send the editor a letter from the Commission about correcting the article. He continued stating that the editor's article "Atlas Alive" reported that listing a building in the National Register of Historic Places "brings a hefty number of restrictions on renovations" and that is not true. Mr. Sharrer asked the Commission for its support to send the Tulsa World editor a letter to correct the article.

The Commission unanimously approved support of a letter to be written having Vice-Chairman Sober's signature and sent to the

Tulsa World editor about corrections that should be made to the editor's article regarding the Atlas Historic Building.

Commissioner Turner stated that he didn't want the Commission to let up on their standard of requirements. He believes that the boards are taking too much time reviewing certain proposals due to lack of information. He added that he believes that the committee and the commission aren't getting enough information on the Certificates of Appropriateness Applications/Proposals for the committee and commission to make a final determination.

Staff introduced Jennifer Morrison to the Commission. Ms. DeCort stated that Ms. Morrison is an intern assisting the Tulsa Preservation Commission on historic preservation projects. The Commission welcomed Ms. Morrison.

8. Other Business

This agenda item is reserved for public comment or presentations to the TPC.

- A. Will Rogers High School window replacement proposal –
Bob LaBass
Vote Needed

Executive Director of Bond Projects at Tulsa Public Schools, Bob LaBass introduced himself to the Commission. Mr. LaBass stated that he would like the Commission to please support his proposal for window replacements of the Will Rogers High School. He stated that the window replacements will consist of having one (1) operable window in each class room; and the rest of the windows will be fixed. He stated that the new windows will be metal and will have the muntin and glazing pattern to match the original windows.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to support Mr. LaBass' proposal for window replacements of the Will Rogers High School Building. Commissioner O'Neal seconded the motion.

Vice-Chair Sober asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve and Support Bob LaBass' proposal for

window replacements of the Will Rogers High School Building:

- (1) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (2) Secretary Wood;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Jack Hodgson;
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Jim Turner;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Bob Winchester;
- (9) Matt King; &
- (10) Pamela Curtis;
- (11) Charles Gilmore;
- (12) Anne Pollard; &
- (13) Elizabeth Wright;

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

None.

B. Preservation Easement for 7007 S. Delaware Place – Martin Newman

Prior Tulsa Preservation Commissioner Martin Newman asked the Commission to please review the preservation easement of the Ward Home at 7007 S. Delaware Place. He stated that the architectural façade easement property is made between him and the City of Tulsa. Mr. Newman would like to preserve this house on the 1.7 acres of land as if it was in an historic preservation (hp) zoned area.

Mr. Newman was proud to announce that the Ward Home constitutes a historic property within the context of Tulsa's history and is soon to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places maintained by the United States Department of the Interior. Mr. Newman asked the Commission to please review the Architectural Façade Easement at 71st Street and Delaware Place and make a final determination on it next month for support of the easement.

Vice-Chairman Sober asked the Commission to please review the Architectural Façade Easement for the next 30 days to vote on at our next meeting. He asked Mrs. Warrior to place this item on the next meeting agenda for action to be taken.

9. Adjournment

There being no other business, Vice-Chair Sober adjourned the meeting at 1:21 p.m. The Regular Tulsa Preservation Commission Meeting of September 10, 2009 was recorded; and the Meeting Minutes for this meeting were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

Note: Please notify Mrs. Warrior by e-mail at Fwarrior@ci.tulsa.ok.us that you have received the information forwarded to you. Project plans will be available at the Planning Department office for review.

*K:/Planning/FW/MINS 09 10 2009R TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on 10 08 2009*